Charting the Course of Information Literacy With SAILS

Tom Adam, IL Coordinator, University of Western Ontario
Sophie Bury, Business Librarian, York University
Jennifer Dekker, Reference Librarian, University of Ottawa
Ilo-Katryn Maimets, Science Librarian, York University
Project SAILS

- Part 1 – Framework
- Part 2 – Implementation
- Part 3 – Results
- Part 4 – Next Steps
1: Setting the Framework

- What is SAILS?
- Objectives
- Broad overview of test
- 3 Phases
- Participants
- Number of questions – random generation
- Canadian participation
Why SAILS?

• Information Literacy Explosion
• ACRL Standards
• Accountability
• Program assessment
• International participation
• Common language
• Standardized methodology
Key Questions

• How do we know if a student is information literate?
• Does the library and its programs contribute to the attainment of these skills?
• Does information literacy make a difference to student success?
Goals for Kent Team

• Easily administered test instrument
• Valid and reliable
• ACRL objectives as the foundation
• Cross institutional application
• Acceptable to administrators
Skill Sets

• More useful test results
  – Activities and processes more closely aligned with how we teach

• 12 unique skills articulated
  – Integrated with ACRL objectives
  – Standards 1, 2, 3 & 5
Question development

- Multiple choice format
- Randomly generate testing subset
- Tests cohort groups – not individuals
- Examined for
  - language clarity, jargon, plausibility
Item testing

• 1-1 student testing
• Small group testing
• Field trials
What is the term for an online resource that shows what materials a library owns? CHECK ONLY ONE ANSWER.

[ ] bibliography
[ ] keyword
[ ] library catalog
[ ] research database
[ ] subject heading
What is the term for an online resource that shows what materials a library owns?

CHECK ONLY ONE ANSWER.

[ ] library catalog

ACRL Objectives 2.1.3.4 & 2.3.2.2
SAILS Skill Set 4
What is the "invisible college"?
CHECK ONLY ONE ANSWER.

[ ] a phenomenon that describes all the information sources that students don't know about

[ ] collections of resources, such as archives, that are not open to the public

[ ] method for taking classes through distance learning

[ ] term used to describe all the informal ways which students learn

[ ] unpublished communication among faculty, such as personal contacts, listservs, email
What is the "invisible college"?
CHECK ONLY ONE ANSWER.

[ ] unpublished communication among faculty, such as personal contacts, listservs, email

ACRL Objectives 1.2.1.2
SAILS Skill Set 2
You hear on a radio talk show that Mad Cow Disease may have been found in the United States. How might you determine the truth of this statement?

CHOOSE ONLY ONE ANSWER

[ ] Call for a transcript or the program from the radio station
[ ] Check the fbifiles.com web site for information the government itself might not release to the public
[ ] Discuss the news with colleagues who might have heard the program
[ ] Look up the topic in the American Council on Beef web site for current news
[ ] Search for Mad Cow Disease on the U.S. Department of Agriculture web site.
Canadian Content

- 42 questions
  - Variant spelling for words
catalog/catalogue
  - Legal differences
copyright
  - Canadian context and examples
College/University
You hear on a radio talk show that Mad Cow Disease may have been found in Canada. How might you determine the truth of this statement?

CHOOSE ONLY ONE ANSWER

[ ] Call for a transcript or the program from the radio station

[ ] Check the CSISfiles.com web site for information the government itself might not release to the public

[ ] Discuss the news with colleagues who might have heard the program

[ ] Look up the topic in the Canadian Cattlemen’s Association web site for current news

[ ] Search for Mad Cow Disease on the Department of Agriculture and Agri-Food web site.
You are assigned a report for your political science class on testimony given by the US Sec. of the U.N. 10 days ago at a congressional hearing. What research tools would be most helpful in finding information about the address?

CHECK ALL THAT APPLY.

[ ] search for articles in Yahoo News Directory (online)
[ ] search for articles in New York Times (online)
[ ] search for articles in The Reader’s Guide to Periodical Literature (reference room)
[ ] search for articles in the Social Science Index (reference room)
[ ] search for books in university library’s catalog (online)
You are assigned a report for your political science class on an address to Parliament made by the United Nations Secretary 10 days ago. What research tools would be most helpful in finding information about the address?

CHECK ALL THAT APPLY.

[ ] search for articles in Yahoo Canada News Directory (online)
[ ] search for articles in Canadian Newsstand (online)
[ ] search for articles in The Reader’s Guide to Periodical Literature (reference room)
[ ] search for articles in the Social Science Index (reference room)
[ ] search for books in university library’s catalogue (online)
Phase I - 2002-03
- Small sample of 8 institutions

Phase II - 2003-04
- 40 institutions
- 4 Canadian schools
  - UBC, Alberta, Brandon, Western
Phase III - 2004-05

- 67 institutions
- 3 additional Canadian schools
  - UBC, Alberta, Brandon, Manitoba, Western, York, New Brunswick
Part 2: How SAILS Phase III was Implemented

- Multiple Test Environments
- Multiple Formats
- Offered 2x/year
- Reporting at ALA
Context at York

• 45,000+ undergrads, 1,400 faculty
  – includes librarians
• Information Literacy at York
  – IL Committee formed early 2004
  – IL Program coordinator – new position Aug 2004
  – 700+ IL sessions (2004-2005)
    • 21,000+ student contacts
• Rationale for assessment
• York’s assessment culture/history including LIBQUAL
• Participation in Phase III
Phase III at York

- **HPRC** (Human Participants Research Committee) Ethics Submission  
  - Summer 2004
- Implementation  
  - Spring 2005
- Unmonitored testing environment
- All undergraduates had option to participate
- Test administered online
Context at Western

- 25,000 undergrads, 1,300 faculty
- Long tradition of teaching
- 950 sessions, 31,000 student contacts
- Information Literacy Coordinator (2004)
- Teaching Support Centre (2004)
- Participation in SAILS Phase II and III
Phase II

- NMREB (research ethics) late 2003
- 2 large first year classes
  - Politics & Biology
- February implementation
- Highly monitored test environment
- Electronic version of the survey
Phase III

- NMREB submission late 2004
- Spring implementation
- Unmonitored testing environment
- Entire undergraduate population
- Electronic test available 24/7
Consent

I have read the above information about the Project SAILS research project and I agree to participate. All questions have been answered to my satisfaction.

Click either:

YES  ○
NO  ○ If you click NO you will not be able to complete the survey.

Please enter your STUDENT ID NUMBER: _______________________

Year
○ 1
○ 2
○ 3
○ 4
○ Grad

☐ Opt out of the draw for the Apple iPod mini

Click  SUBMIT  to start the survey.
You forgot to enter your current year in the programme.

**Back to the survey**
Please return to the information / consent page, enter all information, then click SUBMIT to advance to the survey.

**Quit the survey**
Thanks for your interest in Project SAILS. You can return to complete the survey at a later time.
1. Which of the following actions qualify as plagiarism?

Choose all that apply.

- Including a paragraph from an article as long as you change a few of the words.
- Reporting statistics from the Census of Canada.
- Turning in a paper written by someone else.
- Using another person's ideas in your research paper without attribution.
- Using commonly known information without attribution.

2. Which of the following provide information?

Choose all that apply.

- Folk art
- Personal stories
- Research reports
Phase III

Standardized Assessment of Information Literacy Skills Research Project

Phase III - 2004/05

Kent State University Association of Research Libraries

DATE: 2005/4/6

NAME: Homer Simpson

STUDENT NUMBER: 999999999

This certifies that this student completed the Project SAILS survey on the date indicated.

Thanks for participating in the SAILS research project. Return to Western Libraries homepage.
Partners

- **ULO endorsement** – financial support – upfront SAILS participation fee and prizes
- **Ethics Approval**
- **Registrar’s Office** - Demographic data
- **Library Computing Services** – mounting of web front-end
- **Faculty** – buy-in sought in selected disciplines
- **Students** – proactive in seeking participation e.g. student councils and distribution of promotional materials
- **Librarians** – promotion at student orientation days and in IL classes
Promotion

• Hired students to run some of the advertising
• Web Site – Home Page (What’s New)
• Poster, Flyer, Faculty & Student newsletters
• Draw for Prizes
Participate in our survey and enter a draw for PRIZES!!!!

What's in it for me?
You can enter a draw to win the grand prize of a DVD player! Other prizes are photocopier cards each worth $20.

What kind of questions are we asking?
We are asking questions about your library and research skills.

Who developed the survey?
The survey was developed at Kent State University and is sponsored by the Association of Research Libraries. York is working in partnership with Kent State to refine the survey so that it can be used to test future generations of undergraduate students.

Why get involved?
To help your professors and librarians understand what you need to know about doing research and writing papers so they can teach you necessary skills during library workshops. Ultimately, it will help us to know what to teach you for a successful academic experience.

Are we alone?
No. York University has decided to join over 140 other North American universities – 6 Canadian – to assist in creating this survey.

How long does it take?
About 30-35 minutes of your time.

How can I participate?
If you are an undergraduate student you may complete the online survey at:
http://epsilon.library.yorku.ca/sailsform.htm
• Presentations to Faculty
• Integration into IL Programs
• Easy access from Library page
• Incentives
• “Splash” screens
Promotional Materials

THERE IS ONLY ONE WEEK LEFT

... for you to complete a short library survey and win a chance for one of three iPod Minis ...

All Western undergrads are eligible. It only takes about 30 minutes of your time and can be completed online.

Click the button on the Library homepage and follow the instructions.

You may win an iPod mini just by participating. The draw will happen next week, at the end of the survey period.
Part 3: SAILS Results

- **Number of Participants by April 22 2005**
  - YorkU - 276
  - UWO - 1,727
  - Canadian - 3,860
  - USA - 30,804
  - Total - 34,664

- **Number of Institutions by April 22 2005**
  - Canadian - 4 (YorkU, UWO, UM, BrandonU)
  - U.S. - 63
  - Total - 67
Demographic Picture

• Data collected for each student:
  – Gender, Year of study, Discipline, Ethnicity and GPA

• More female participants, especially in Canada

• Canadian results show more of a balance across all 4 years of study

• U.S. Ethnicity and GPA equivalent not available or not comparable in Canadian context –
  – Ethnicity data is never collected in Canada
# Demographic Picture: Test Takers, Highest Representation by Discipline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Discipline</th>
<th>UWO</th>
<th>YorkU</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Biological and Biomedical</td>
<td>8.6%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>11.7%</td>
<td>23.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering</td>
<td>3.5%</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English Lang &amp; Lit</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>22.4%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychology</td>
<td>4.1%</td>
<td>13.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Sciences</td>
<td>21.9%</td>
<td>17.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visual &amp; Performing Arts</td>
<td>6.7%</td>
<td>3.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Standard 1
Average Scores

The information literate student determines the nature and extent of the information needed

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALL</td>
<td>.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UWO</td>
<td>.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YorkU</td>
<td>.55</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Standard 2
Average Scores

The information literate student accesses needed information effectively and efficiently

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALL</td>
<td>.52</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UWO</td>
<td>.53</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YorkU</td>
<td>.53</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The information literate student evaluates information and its sources critically and incorporates selected information into his or her knowledge base and value system.

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALL</td>
<td>.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UWO</td>
<td>.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YorkU</td>
<td>.56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Standard 5
Average Scores

The information literate student understands many of the economic, legal, and social issues surrounding the use of information and accesses and uses information ethically and legally

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>.53</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ALL</td>
<td>.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UWO</td>
<td>.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YorkU</td>
<td>.53</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Standard 4

• The information literate student uses information effectively to accomplish a specific purpose
  – Not Tested – multiple choice not appropriate format for testing
No significant Divergences with Cross-Institutional Data

• Cross-institutional results are grouped around the midpoint
  – Provide a consistent benchmark
  – Indication of soundness of the questions

• Question remains:
  – Do students actually understand what they are meant to understand at the midpoint?
12 Skill sets

1. Developing a topic,
2. Scholarly communication / Structure of disciplines,
3. Identifying & Distinguishing among sources,
4. Selecting finding tools,
5. Selecting search terms,
6. Conducting the search,
7. Database mechanics,
8. Evaluating and revising search results,
9. Retrieving sources,
10. Evaluating and selecting sources,
11. Documenting sources,
12. Ethical legal and social issues around the use of information
Skill Sets
Trends & Observations

Strongest performance:
1. Developing a Research Strategy
   All: .56; UWO: .60; YorkU: .61
2. Scholarly Communication/Structure of Disciplines
   All: .63; UWO: .66; YorkU: .65

Weakest performance:
5. Selecting Search Terms
   All: .47; UWO: 48; YorkU: .47
7. Understanding Information Retrieval Systems
   All: .45; UWO: .45; YorkU: .47
Significance of the Development of the 12 Skill Sets

- Translate the ACRL standards into more meaningful processes.
- More closely related to the work we do as instructors.
- Provides guidelines on where to direct IL instruction.
Conclusions:

• Really need break-outs to draw deeper conclusions about these results
  – Question level analysis
  – Individual performance data
Analysis of Results at Item (Question) Level

- Can pinpoint student strengths, weaknesses
  - more meaningful when results are analyzed at question level within each of 12 skill sets
  - identify high to low competency
- A few examples follow for Skill Set 6 - *Constructing the Search* which showed overall average scores of:
  All (.54), UWO (.56), and York (.56)
SAILS Data Report – Skill Set 6

Constructing the Search - Example

Average Scores Overall and Individual Item Scores (Scale of 0 to 1)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2s</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>251b</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>108</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>167</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>154a</td>
<td>247</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>240</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>154</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>251d</td>
<td>253</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16b</td>
<td>253a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>253e</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15c</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15b</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>154a</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>154e</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>155</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>154b</td>
<td>251c</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>252c</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>251a</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>252d</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>252</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25d</td>
<td>15e</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>246</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15c</td>
<td>252a</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Difficult Items

York Average - 0.56

Across-Institutional Average - 0.54
Result Showing
Very High Ranking Score –
Author Searching
Ranked as Second Easiest Item (.24)

If you want to find books that Charlotte Bronte wrote, which search would you do?

Choose only one answer

a) author: bronte
b) Subject: bronte
c) Title: bronte
When using a research database, which search is the most effective one for identifying articles on how weight affects self esteem?

Choose only one answer

a) How weight affects self esteem
b) Self esteem
c) Weight
d) **Weight and self esteem**
e) Weight or self esteem
If you wanted to find books about the American poet Maya Angelou, which search would you do?

Choose only one answer.

a) Author: angelou

b) **Subject: angelou**

c) Title: angelou
Result Showing
Low Level Competency
- Use of Boolean “Or” Operator (.67)

If you wanted to search for a topic that has several synonyms (for example - young, people, adolescents, teenagers, teens), which operator would you use?

Choose only one answer
a) Adj
b) And
c) Near
d) Not
e) Or
Which of the following search statements best utilizes nesting search operators for a communication research paper on speech anxiety

Choose only one answer

a) Speech and talk and (anxiety or fear)
b) Speech or talk and (anxiety and fear)
c) Speech or talk and (anxiety or fear)
d) (Speech or talk) and anxiety or fear
e) (Speech or talk) and (anxiety or fear)
Part 4: Next Steps

At our Institutions:

– Address areas where student skills are weak
  • Help us show both librarians and faculty where instruction might be focussed

– Develop instructional and assessment tools
  • General and subject-specific
  • E.g. build pre-tests/post-tests
More at our institutions

– Use SAILS results to leverage support for Information Literacy on our campuses
  • Among fellow Librarians
  • Among Faculty
  • Administrators

– Be proactive about sharing the SAILS results with librarians, administrators and faculty on campus –

– Show we engage in assessment thereby lending more credibility to our efforts
Plans at Kent State

• Revisiting original research question analysis of the data
  – determine if the instrument is viable.
• Refining questions
  – more difficult items needed
• Discipline Specific tools
  – Biology, Communication Studies, History and Education to begin with
Cost-Recovery Model

By Fall of 2006
• Development of data bank of questions for use by institutions
• Fee-based, cost recovery model
  – $3/student up to $2000 cap per institution
  – To feature easy report generation - colour PDF
  – Online tutorial for data analysis

By 2007
• Hope to be able to offer a system that can generate individual student scores
Thank you

• Comments??

• Questions??