Chapter 5. Analysis and discussion of findings. Perceptions of the issues and features of Broomhall, information needs, and provision

> "What's the right way and the wrong way to report results [of research]? Disinterestedly, so that the other man is free to understand precisely what you are saying, and as nearly as possible not covering it with your desires." -- Nobel laureate, Richard Phillips Feynman, *The Pleasure of Finding Things Out,* (Feynman, 2001: 108).

5.1 Introduction

This chapter presents the analysis, and discussions of the major findings of the thesis (which includes the merging of both: the pilot and the main study).

5.1.1 Overview

This chapter also analyses and discusses the interrelationships of those findings, with the needs of information recorded in documents from the residents of the Broomhall neighbourhood, and with the various ways that information providers tried to meet them.

5.1.2 How the issues and features of Broomhall became information needs

The same six major issues, and two major features, that emerged as the major variables and findings of this thesis, have been translated at the same time by the researcher as the eight major information needs (as explained in the following sections).

Broomhall, like any other neighbourhood where people live, work, play, enjoy, and suffer, has negative (or controversial, or adverse) or positive (or less controversial or adverse) features, which affect people. People perceive these as problems, or issues, but seldom as needs, and almost never as information needs. Thus, the researcher considered that these six major issues, and two major features that emerged in this thesis were precisely the eight major information needs perceived by the residents of Broomhall.

However, Broomhall has also positive (or less negative, or controversial, or adverse) features. However, the negative features, thus problems, and issues, are the more pervasive throughout the outcomes, discussions, conclusions, and recommendations of this project. This was due to the fact that the interviewees belonged only to the working and middle classes and the majority of the population belonged to the poor working class (mostly from section A, and partially from B) as emerged from observation and the literature.

As explained in Chapter 4 (see section 4.3.2), these findings evolved from the pilot study –*The Broomhall community profile*-- that the researcher conducted from 30 September 2003, until 18 October 2004, and that he presented as part of the requirements towards his MPhil/PhD Transfer report in 2005 (Muela-Meza, 2005a).

The major issues of Broomhall in 2005 that emerged from two focus groups, literature and observation were:

1) Housing issues.
2) Unemployment issues.
3) Health issues.
4) Multiculturalism and social exclusion issues (including social class divides).
5) Educational issues.

The findings of this thesis have been classified into two categories: issues and features. Whereas issues represent a more negative perception of the reality, features a more positive perception.

From the findings of the pilot study, the issues from 1 to 4 (housing, unemployment, health, and multiculturalism and social exclusion issues) remained as being issues, but number 5 (educational issues) evolved from being an issue into a feature, thus having a more positive perception. This means that the issues found in the pilot study not only remained as being perceived negatively, but also that they evolved in negativism throughout the four years of the PhD research span. However, on the contrary, in the case of the educational issues, the preliminary negative perceptions from the pilot study evolved into positive perceptions; educational features. Thus, this merging of the findings from the pilot and the main study shows not only a consistent evolution in the negative perceptions of residents, but also a prudent reconsideration of an issue becoming a positive feature.

Thus, the findings of the pilot study were used as a basis for the main study. Hence, this chapter presents the findings of the pilot study that evolved and merged into the findings of the main study; the whole of the findings of this thesis. Thus, the findings of the thesis were grouped into six major issues and two major features that emerged from the Broomhall neighbourhood.

These are the six major issues that emerged from the thesis, where the evolution from the pilot study is also represented:

1) Issues of territoriality or uses of the land (e.g. housing; expansion of Sheffield and Hallam universities becoming university student villages). These issues evolved from the *housing issues* of the pilot study.
2) Issues of poverty, social and economic inequalities (e.g. unemployment, debt, crime). These issues evolved from the *unemployment issues* of the pilot study.
3) Health issues (e.g. drug addiction, lack of: green public open space, playgrounds, and sports and leisure facilities). These issues evolved from the *health issues* of the pilot study.
4) Political issues;
5) Cultural issues (e.g. multicultural, ethnic, religious, and national issues). These issues evolved from the *multiculturalism and social exclusion* from the pilot study.
6) Communication issues.

These are the two major features that emerged from the thesis, where the evolution from the pilot study is also represented:

1) Transport features.
2) Educational features. These features evolved from the *educational issues* from the pilot study.

5.1.2.1   NEGATIVE ISSUES, AND INFORMATION NEEDS PERCEIVED BY THE RESIDENTS OF BROOMHALL –AN OVERVIEW

In Table 5.1 below the reader can assess at a glimpse the most negative issues of the Broomhall neighbourhood as perceived by residents and some information providers, hence, the most negative information needs. Not all the perceptions form a consensus, but some single expressions are included in order to report more comprehensively the most significant features, or issues, or problems as perceived by respondents, which shed light on the aim and objectives of this project.

The table is divided in three columns: the first shows the major findings, the second presents evidence either by respondents or documents, and the third is the translation of the findings into the eight major information needs of the thesis (as emerged from the major six issues and two features).

Table 5.1 Negative issues of Broomhall		
Major findings	**Evidence by respondents and documents**	**Translation of findings into major issues, or features, or information needs**
British government politically oppressive and excluding people from their political rights	[a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 08]	Political issues; communication issues
Christian charities with vested religious or commercial interests other than the social aims they pursue	[a working class resident from section A] [R.I.07]; [a working class resident from section B] [R.I.10]	Cultural issues; political issues
Closure of Broomhall Nursery at Mushroom Lane branch	*(Star (Sheffield),* 2004e)	Educational features; issues of territoriality or uses of the land; political issues
Communication features and issues	A general consensus	Communication issues
Crime (e.g. robberies; thugs; violent attacks against the person; muggings; car and property break-ins; drug dealing crime; intentional and unintentional shooting crimes; arsons)	A general consensus; (*BBC News (Sheffield),* 2003; 2004; 2005a; 2007; Star (Sheffield), *2004a;* 2005a; 2005d; 2006a; 2006e)	Issues of poverty, social, and economic inequalities; political issues
Cultural forms of socializing with mild toxic substances (e.g. smoking tobacco [1] and drinking alcohol in British pubs and clubs; Khat chewing by Somali, etc.)	A general consensus	Cultural issues; health issues; political issues
Debt issues	[a working class resident from section A] [F.G.03.A]; (Muela-Meza, 2005b)	Issues of poverty, social, and economic inequalities; political issues
Deprivation in the provision of social services for the homeless, refugees, asylum seekers, and the destitute	A general consensus	Issues of poverty, social, and economic inequalities; political issues; cultural issues
Deprivation of green public open spaces (e.g. parks, playgrounds) for poor and working classes	A general consensus	Health issues; issues of poverty, social, and economic inequalities; political issues
Deprivation of health services provision	[a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 01]; [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 08]; [a middle class respondent from section C] [F.G.01.C]; [a working class respondent from section C] [F.G.01.A]; (*Star (Sheffield),* 2005d; 2005e; *2006b)*	Health issues; political issues
Deprived living conditions of poor and working classes	A general consensus	Issues of poverty, social, and economic inequalities; political issues
Developers and landlords	A general consensus; (*Star (Sheffield), 2002a; 2004b; 2007a;*	Issues of territoriality or uses of the land; political issues

---
[1] Smoking inside pubs was legal at the time of data collection.

	Broomhall News, 2004a*)*	
Drug addiction	A general consensus	Health issues; cultural issues
Drug dealing	A general consensus; (*Star (Sheffield),* 2004c; *BBC News (Sheffield),* 2003; 2005b; 2006)	Issues of poverty, social, and economic inequalities; health issues
Education	(*Star (Sheffield),* 2004g)	Educational features
Hallam and Sheffield universities territorial expansionism in the neighbourhood and becoming student villages	A general consensus; (*Star (Sheffield),* 2007a)	Issues of territoriality or uses of the land; political issues
Housing for poor and working classes	A general consensus	Issues of territoriality or uses of the land; political issues
Intercultural misunderstandings (e.g. misunderstandings of Christians vs. Muslims, or vice versa)	A general consensus	Cultural issues; political issues
Intolerance of some neighbours to diversity (e.g. neighbours intolerant to pub life, student life, BME (Black Minority Ethnic) life)	(*Star (Sheffield),* 2006f)	Cultural issues; political issues
Media vs. BMEs (Black Minority Ethnic) (mostly from African, Middle East and Arabic countries)	[a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.A]	Communication issues; cultural issues; political issues
Poverty, social and economic inequalities	A general consensus	Issues of poverty, social, and economic inequalities; political issues
Racism of the police against BMEs (Black Minority Ethnic) (namely vs. Somalis)	[a working class resident from section A] [R.I. 07]; [a working class resident from section B of Broomhall] [R.I. 10]; [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.A]; [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.01]	Cultural issues; political issues; communication issues
Resurgence of fascism, white supremacists, the fascist British National Party, and British National Front in Broomhall, Sheffield, and UK wide	[a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 08]; (*Star (Sheffield),* 2003; 2005b; 2006d)	Political issues
The Broomhall Forum and the Broomhall Cosmopolitan Centre, Ltd.	A general consensus	Political issues
The Sheffield YMCA having sold its premises on Broomhall Road (and depriving people from their gym, pitches and all sport and health providing services)	A general consensus (except for the positive perceptions self-granted by the YMCA, e.g. (*Star (Sheffield),* 2002b)	Health issues; political issues; issues of territoriality or uses of the land;
Transport	*Star (Sheffield),* (2007c)	Transport features
Tribalism of BMEs (Black Minority Ethnic) (namely from African, Middle East, and Arabic speaking countries)	[a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.B]; [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.A]; [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.C]	Political issues; cultural issues; communication issues
UK having made the war against the innocent people of Iraq and Afghanistan	[a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.C]; [a working class resident from section A] [R.I. 07]; [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 08]	Political issues; cultural issues; communication issues
Unemployment	A general consensus	Issues of poverty, social, and economic inequalities

5.1.2.2 POSITIVE FEATURES, AND INFORMATION NEEDS PERCEIVED BY THE RESIDENTS OF BROOMHALL – AN OVERVIEW

On the other hand, in Table 5.2 below the reader can assess at a glimpse an illustrative range of positive features of Broomhall, hence, positive information needs, and be able to contrast them with their negative counterparts described above in Table 5.1.

At first sight, the reader may find the snapshot of Table 5.2 as a very positive profile. However, even though some respondents mentioned there that there are some positive features of Broomhall, the reader should bear in mind that those features did not emerge as purely positive.

Therefore, the author has addressed them as positive or less negative, controversial, and adverse features, because although they are positive they also include such negative aspects, which shadow their positive characteristics. Nevertheless, by triangulating the respondents' perceptions with data generated by observation and documents, it was possible to highlight some features as mainly positive, regardless of how negatively some respondents perceived them. The main positive features hence were: educational services provision, and transport services provision.

The table is divided in three columns: the first shows the major findings, the second presents evidence either by respondents or documents, and the third is the translation of the findings into the eight major information needs of the thesis (as emerged from the major six issues and two features).

Table 5.2 Positive (or less negative, controversial, and adverse) features of Broomhall		
Major findings	**Evidence by respondents and documents**	**Translation of findings into major issues, or features, or information needs**
A friendly community, not racist	[an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.04]	Cultural issues
A good place to live for people of different backgrounds	[an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.01]; [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 08]	Cultural issues
A peaceful area	[an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.01]	Issues of poverty, social, and economic inequalities
Being very near to the City Centre and to all council services, shops, Royal Hallamshire Hospital (RHH) and amenities (5 to 15 minutes walking, sections A and B are the closest to city centre and C and D to Royal Hallamshire Hospital)	A general consensus	Transport features
Broomhall Community Centre; Citywide Learning Centre	General consensus	Educational features
Diversity and mixture of cultures	[a working class respondent from section C] [F.G.01.A]	Cultural issues
Hanover Medical Centre	[a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 01]	Health issues
People know each other in the Hanover Flats, section A; nice flats	[a working class resident from section A] [F.G.03.D]; [a working class resident from section A] [R.I. 07]	Communication issues; issues of territoriality or uses of the land
Sheffield City Council libraries providing books to children and their parents in partnership with central government Sure Start educational program (at Sharrow) through the Broomhall Nursery	[a working class resident from section A] [R.I. 09]; (*Star (Sheffield)*, 2006c)	Educational features
The neighbourhood newspaper *Broomhall News*	[a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 04]	Educational features
Transport	[a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.A]; (*Star (Sheffield)*, 2004f)	Transport features

5.1.3 Information provision

An information provider specifies this idea in relation to advice provision to Broomhall residents:

> *"I don't particularly think another library is what Broomhall needs, what they need is more advice services. There is Internet on the Stow Centre and the City Wide Learning [actually both closed doors for good by 2006, MUELA-MEZA, Z.M.], and in the libraries, libraries are not the places where you can find information and advice on your entitlements and benefits and stuff like that. I think it would be good if we would have better accommodation and outreach in Broomhall as a permanent basis, yes. And definitively it's much needed now."* [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.05].

And many residents confirm this need for *advice and help centres* rather than libraries. Their perceptions will be explained in the next sections, as appropriate in relation to the information needs analysed here.

5.1.3.1 INFORMATION PROVISION THROUGH LETTERBOXES OF BROOMHALL RESIDENTS' HOMES

The author collected, from 16 September 2006 until 16 March 2007, all the documents that arrived at his home through the letterbox when he lived on Broomspring Lane, section C of Broomhall.

Table 5.3 below shows a summary of the 72 documents or information recorded in documents non solicited by the author that arrived through his letterbox from individuals or organisations.

Table 5.3 Information provision through the letter boxes of Broomhall homes (at least in section C), from 16 September 2006 to 16 March 2007							
Type of document		Letters	Flyer	Newspaper	Booklet	Book	Total
Commercial sector							56
	Alcoholic drinks		1				
	Banking services (credit cards)		1				
	Domestic cleaning services		1				
	Fashion		1				
	Health & sports		1		1		
	Insurance (cars, homes)		3				
	Internet and cable TV		5				
	News & publicity			1			
	Organic community shop		1				
	Plumbing; boilers; gas		2				
	Restaurant		1				
	Social parties		1				
	Supermarket		15				
	Telephone & Internet		1				
	Takeaway fast food shop		19				
	Video entertainment		1				
Community & voluntary sector							11
	Educational		3				
	Farm animals						
	Health & sports		1				
	Home energy saving		1				
	Political		3				
	Poverty and Children		1				

	Religions & spirituality		2				5
Statutory sector (Sheffield)							
	Directory of council services					1	
	Environment		1				
	Home building public consultation	1					
	Public service accountability				2		
Total							72

As can be seen from Table 5.3 above, of the 72 documents received: a) 55 are related to commercial information (19 are related to fast food takeaway shops and 15 about supermarkets: CostCutter from Broomhall and Somerfield from Broomhill); b) 11 from the voluntary sector; and c) 5 from the statutory sector in Sheffield.

Given the nature of grey literature and elusive documents, the author could not establish which of these documents can be considered useful for the residents and which were 'rubbish unsolicited post,' because any of them could be perceived as either useful or useless by different residents. That is, it would be another research topic for future LIS practitioners if they wanted to find out what are the type of documents households receive in a given neighbourhood and in a given period.

However, this exercise was carried out because the author is trying to show the whole panorama of community information needs and their provision in the Broomhall neighbourhood, and living in Broomhall was a good idea to show another illustration of how needs might be prompted, or satisfied by 'unsolicited post'. This is only a small sample of documents collected during seven months and in itself does not shed the full spectrum of light of the information provision phenomenon in Broomhall, because whilst it may be true that some of that unsolicited post might be rubbish for some people, on the other hand it may be equally true that some of that unsolicited post might be of help or advice for some other people.

The following are examples that may help explain how the same piece of information recorded in a document and delivered through the post may be helpful for some people, and useless for others.

For instance, if a resident has the information need to know the telephone number of a pizza or kebab shop to order takeaway food to his doorstep, then those documents would meet effectively and efficiently his or her needs, provided he or she save them, organise them, and retrieve them for future use. On the other hand, if another resident prefers to cook at home, he or she follows nutritious food instead of non nutritious food, and he or she considers takeaway food as non nutritious food, then he or she would consider those leaflets useless.

Another example, two of the booklets provided came from the Sheffield City Council, and they are the most important documents from all the 74 collected and analysed, because they show in nearly 100 pages each the full range of services of the council. These sections on information, advice and help services, mainly from the library, amount in each more than 30 pages. That is, with this evidence no one can claim the council does not make an effort to

inform in print in a colourful comprehensive booklet to each of its citizens, provided that that post be a citywide post.

However, in seven months, the council posted those two booklets and never again approached the author's home (and by inference, any other home), except for one letter related to some building extension applications. No other information from the Council came through the letterboxes. Hence, it might be inferred that the Council assumes that every citizen: a) keeps safe the semi-annual directory, b) reads English, and c) has a land telephone line and/or Internet. However, in this study that attitude of the council (and for that matter of its library, information, advice, and help services) is a patronising one, to say the least, because a recent major research project on families with disabled children found that written information in the form of leaflets and booklets, under some circumstances tends to alienate rather than inform families:

> "It was apparent that written information was not enough by itself. Indeed, the assumption that as long as numerous leaflets and booklets are produced families will be able to inform themselves was dismissed as both simplistic and potentially dangerous" (Mitchell and Sloper, 2002: 78).

However, the documental information from the Council through the letterboxes is not the only form they provide to citizens. They also do it through more established organisations which may fit one way or the other into the Documental Information Institution (DII) form of information provider as defined in this thesis (see Rendón Rojas, 2005: 136-137, and Chapter 2).

The next section explains the information provision through displays at the premises of Broomhall organisations.

5.1.3.2 INFORMATION PROVISION DISPLAYED AT PREMISES OF BROOMHALL ORGANISATIONS (IN BOTH DOCUMENTAL INFORMATION INSTITUTIONS (DIIS) AND NON-DIIS)

During the time this project took place the author visited several organisations within Broomhall or nearby that collected documental information and displayed it in their premises for the public's free access. He collected a copy of each document displayed within their premises only once on a given date within the time span of four years this PhD research took place.

These are the information providers' premises assessed:

1) Broomhall Community Centre (BCC),
2) Broomhall Forum (BF),
3) Sharrow Citizens Advice Bureau (SCAB; this is located outside Broomhall but has a clinic at the Hanover Medical Centre in section C),
4) Hanover Medical Centre (HMC),
5) Mobile Library (from the council library and information services servicing in Broomhall),
6) Sharrow Community Forum (SCF; off Broomhall but with clinics in section A),
7) Stow Centre (SC) (now closed since mid 2006),
8) Saint Mark's Church (SMC; this is located outside Broomhall but with other 2 churches within section C serves in coordination),

9) and Waitrose (W; just metres off section A, just to show the high contrast of upper market supermarket off the road of the 10th most deprived estate in Sheffield: Hanover).

Only the CAB and the ML fit into the DII (Documental Information Institution) concept employed here, but the others were included as well just to show the reader what type of documental information other centres provide resembling a Documental Information Institution.

The Sheffield City Council Central Library at Surrey Street, city centre, was omitted for several reasons: because the mobile library already represented it; because residents considered it 'far away' from Broomhall (it is not far away, simply too big and depersonalised than smaller branches like Highfield); and for practical matters, because at the time the author tried to collect one sample of each document he found that this amounted to more than three thousand documents; thus it was beyond Broomhall neighbourhood range and beyond Broomhall-specific provision scope, since it had a Sheffield city-wide provision scope.

However, as a matter of fact, the Central Library in all documental information respects is the most complete Documental Information Institution (DII) from any other within or outside Broomhall. But paradoxically, it was the least used DII by Broomhall residents when advice or help services were needed. For advice or help services the Sharrow Citizens Advice Bureau (SCAB) was the most used by Broomhall residents, both at the Broomhall clinics at Hanover Medical Centre and at its main offices in Sharrow.

The next tables, then, show the different sources of information recorded in documents provided by the formal *Documental Information Institutions (DIIs)* such as the Sharrow Citizens' Advice Bureau (SCAB) and the Mobile Library of the Sheffield City Council Information Services, and other information centres similar to a *DII*.

Hence, in this section an analysis of those documents is presented in the following Tables from 5.11 to 5.15.

Table 5.4 below shows the *Community and voluntary sector documents collected at information providers' premises.*

Table 5.4 Community and voluntary sector documents collected at information providers' premises										
Document type	Information provider									
	BCC	BF	CAB	HMC	ML	SCF	SC	SMC	W	Total
Advice services	6	0	3	3	0	0	0	0	0	**12**
BME (Black Minority Ethnic) organisations (inc. refugees & asylum seekers)	4	0	2	0	0	4	0	1	0	**11**
Educational	17	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	**19**
Environment	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	**3**
Financial help; credit unions	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	**4**
Health & sports	18	0	1	0	0	5	0	0	0	**24**
Home energy saving	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	**1**
Jobs	5	0	3	0	0	3	0	0	0	**11**
Leisure, arts, festivals	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	**1**

	BCC	BF	CAB	HMC	ML	SCF	SC	SMC	W	Total
Pets	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	**1**
Politics	3	0	0	0	0	1	0	4	0	**8**
Religion & spirituality	6	2	0	0	0	0	0	6	0	**14**
Safety	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	**2**
Social services	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	**1**
Total	**69**	**2**	**9**	**3**	**1**	**16**	**0**	**12**	**0**	**112**
Abbreviations and dates of collection of documents: BCC: Broomhall Community Centre (11.11.2005); BF: Broomhall Forum (24.11.2005); CAB: Citizens Advice Bureau (14.11.2005); HMC: Hanover Medical Centre (12.12.2006); ML: Mobile Library from Sheffield City Council Library, Archives and Information Services located at Exeter Drive, section A (04.06.2007); SC: Stow Centre (18.08.2005); SMC: Saint Mark's Church (18.08.2005); W: Waitrose (12.12.2006).										

Table 5.5 below shows the *Statutory sector (central government) documents collected at information providers' premises.*

Table 5.5 Statutory sector (central government) documents collected at information providers' premises

Document type	Information provider									
	BCC	BF	CAB	HMC	ML	SCF	SC	SMC	W	Total
Cabinet Office	0	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	**1**
Environment	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	**1**
Health & sports	28	0	0	14	0	1	0	1	0	**44**
HM Treasury	0	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	**1**
Home energy saving	4	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	**4**
HM Inland Revenue	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	**1**
Leisure, arts, festivals	5	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	**6**
Radio	1	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	0	**3**
Safety	13	0	2	0	0	0	0	1	0	**16**
UK Online Centres	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	**1**
Total of documents	**53**	**2**	**2**	**14**	**3**	**2**	**0**	**2**	**0**	**78**
Abbreviations and dates of collection of documents as in Table 5.4 above.										

Table 5.6 below shows the *Statutory sector (Sheffield City Council) documents collected at information providers' premises.*

Table 5.6 Statutory sector (Sheffield City Council) documents collected at information providers' premises

Document type	Information provider									
	BCC	BF	CAB	HMC	ML	SCF	SC	SMC	W	Total
Catering services	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	**1**
Education	4	0	0	0	1	1	0	1	0	**7**
Elected members	2	0	1	0	0	1	0	1	0	**5**
Environment	16	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	**17**
Funding	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	**2**
Health & sports	1	0	1	1	0	1	0	0	0	**4**
Housing	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	**1**
Information services	4	0	1	4	7	5	0	0	0	**21**
Jobs	4	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	**6**
Leisure, arts, festivals	5	0	0	0	2	0	0	1	0	**8**
Museums & galleries	1	0	0	0	2	0	0	1	0	**4**
Safety	2	1	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	**4**
Social security; benefits	2	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	**3**
Social services	4	0	0	1	2	0	0	0	0	**7**
Transport	0	0	0	1	0	2	0	0	0	**3**
Total of documents	**49**	**1**	**6**	**7**	**15**	**11**	**0**	**4**	**0**	**93**
Abbreviations and dates of collection of documents as in Table 5.4 above.										

Table 5.7 below shows the *Documents from the private sector collected at information providers' premises.*

Table 5.7 Documents from the private sector collected at information providers' premises										
Document type	Information provider									
	BCC	BF	CAB	HMC	ML	SCF	SC	SMC	W	Total
Educational	0	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	**2**
Food	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	3	**3**
Health & sports	4	1	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	**10**
Home energy saving	2	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	**3**
Information services	0	0	0	0	7	1	0	0	0	**8**
Jobs	3	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	**3**
Leisure; arts; festivals	4	0	0	1	3	0	0	1	0	**9**
Total of documents	**13**	**3**	**1**	**6**	**10**	**1**	**0**	**1**	**3**	**38**
Abbreviations and dates of collection of documents as in Table 5.4 above.										

Table 5.8 shows a *Comparison of information providers' documents about their own organisation displayed at their premises.* See table below.

Table 5.8 Comparison of information providers' documents about their own organisation displayed at their premises	
Information provider	No. of documents
Broomhall Community Centre	18
Broomhall Forum	0
Citizens Advice Bureau	2
Hanover Medical Centre	1
Mobile Library (at Exeter Drive, section A)	1
Sharrow Community Forum	5
Stow Centre	2
Saint Mark Church	13
Waitrose	3

As shown in Tables 5.4 through 5.9, the Broomhall Community Centre, was the most comprehensive provider of information recorded in documents. This centre is managed and funded by the Sheffield City Council, but the management is run by individuals, and groups from the community. But the BCC is not a fully operational DII, and not even close. They only have hundreds of flyers available there for anyone who enters and wants to pick up one, but there is no proper service provision of *documental information,* or *advice,* or *help.* The place is more a local centre where people teach extracurricular activities, and a place people rent for parties, and so on.

The Broomhall Community Centre (BCC) is, nevertheless, the real soul of the neighbourhood where all communities 'feel it their own centre'. While the BBC (and for that matter other centres alike which cannot be classified properly as Documental Information Institutions, DIIs, like libraries) have hundreds of flyers in stock available free for everyone, that does not mean that people are effectively served with documental information as in libraries. That is, the BCC is not a DII as defined in this project, hence it does not satisfy people's information needs effectively as a library would do, because it is not a library, and they do not have books as a public library for people of all ages. They do not have librarians either who can give information, advice, help, etc. on a regular schedule; the BCC is a staffed by one single member who works only two hours a day, and not having the credentials as a librarian, she only gives

information related to the centre (rent of the centre for events; scheduling for events and the like).

Moreover, on an even more critical note, the most negative and pressing issue and information need, for the Broomhall residents is territoriality (namely housing), and as was shown in Table 5.6, the Broomhall Community Centre (BCC) had only one single document related to housing. This is further evidence that except for the documental information provided by the Mobile Library or the advice and help by the Sharrow Citizens' Advice Bureau (SCAB), which both are limited, Broomhall residents in general terms are considerably under-provided, and the lower the social class the worse off.

The next sections report, analyse and discuss the eight major findings of this thesis.

5.2 Analysis and discussion of the issues and features of Broomhall, and the interrelationships with information needs and provision, as perceived by residents

The sections here report, analyse and discuss the eight major findings of this thesis: a) the six negative issues and the two positive features that accordingly describe the Broomhall neighbourhood, b) the translation of those eight findings into information needs, and c) the ways that information providers tried to meet those eight information needs.

The way these findings are critically presented, analysed, and discussed follows this logic: 1) first, each issue or feature is presented, 2) then, several interrelationships with information needs are made, and 3) finally, an association is made to information provision.

5.2.1 Issues, information needs, and provision about territoriality or uses of the land

The following sections present, analyse, and discuss the issues, information needs, and provision about territoriality or uses of the land.

5.2.1.1 ISSUES ABOUT TERRITORIALITY OR USES OF THE LAND

From time immemorial territoriality and the uses of the land, also commonly associated with human shelter or housing, have played a determinant role in human evolution. According to a sociologist (Edgell, 1993: 52), the amount of territorial property an individual owns serves as one prominent measure or his or her social class status.

The history of territorial privatization or privatization of the land, is the same as in the earlier forms of accumulation of capital. However, the land is being privatized by capitalists to build not factories like in earlier times, but upper-market residential and business developments; the expropriated peasant and feudal classes of those days are the working, middle, and even capitalist classes of today; the earlier Wilkinson government is today's government.

For instance, in Wilkinson's times his house was attacked by the victims of his policies of enclosures of the commons land. But today, according to one respondent's account, apparently the developers are attacking and setting on fire the houses of the Broomhall residents who resist the capitalist/bourgeois class government policies and corporations (developers) to take over all of their land and homes to build for-profit upper market Housing in Multiple Occupation:

> *"all people in the community say that [person's name omitted for security reasons] got [the house of this person] attacked, petrol bombed by developers because [this person… gender omitted for security reasons] always complained... you know developers have millions of pounds for development and they want to take over the community, but you know, the community can stop them, technically, by getting petitions, complain to the council, by getting signatures, and that is what [gender omitted for security reasons] was doing, getting signatures from lots of people, and writing articles in the papers, throwing shit [sic] basically against the developers basically, no one knows who did it but someone petrol bombed [the house of this person], you know there is no evidence but it's pretty obvious [that developers did it]" [a working class resident from section B of Broomhall] [R.I. 10].*

Perhaps this account is going too far and it may be inconceivable, but Broomhall residents are complaining that they are being intimidated by developers to stop them from complaining to the Council about their "regeneration" plans of "bulldozing" Broomhall old houses and build upper-market Housing in Multiple Occupancy (HMO) for residential or business rents (Star (Sheffield), 2002b). Broomhall residents are complaining that developers are building more and more HMOs (Housing in Multiple Occupancy) and thus pushing poor working class families away from the neighbourhood (*Broomhall News,* 2004a; *Star (Sheffield), 2004b;* Exposed, 2007*).* This is the strategy that the capitalist developers, (backed by the Labour government, central and local, and councillors and MPs from Conservative, Liberal, and even Green parties) are implementing nationwide according to similar experiences of working class residents from other British cities, e.g. Liverpool (Leeming, 2007a; 2007b; Radnedge, 2006); London (Cottage and Fredericks, 2006).

In addition, territorial privatization is not only for residential and business purposes, but also for academic purposes and that is where Sheffield Hallam University (SHU) and the University of Sheffield (UofS) have the same negative effect for the people in the neighbourhood like the capitalist developers (Student Residences Strategy Team, 2004; Department of Marketing and Communications, 2005; Sheffield Hallam University Alumni Association, 2003; *Star (Sheffield);* 2007a). Even though their aims would have a positive impact for them, e.g. medicine, and basically all the scientific and technological findings developed through universities.

The building of facilities for both housing and academic purposes by developers are of much benefit for society, that is an undeniable fact. However, the problem perceived by Broomhall residents is that most of them would never have access to live in the new fancy upper-market HMOs (Housing in Multiple Occupancy) being built in replacement of their old and poor social housing, and the other problem is that it is very unlikely that they would be able to afford to pay the university fees of both SHU or UofS, universities which are pushing the families out of the neighbourhood to build new classrooms, halls, teaching centres, laboratories, and so on, replacing their old and poor social housing with their new academic facilities.

This is the main issue and information need of Broomhall, which affects severely most residents of Broomhall. An information provider captures comprehensively the essence of these issues as being contradictory and conflicting amongst the different social classes within each section or amongst different sections of Broomhall:

> *"Land usage is definitively an issue in Broomhall, for instance there are many people in Broomhall who wanted to hold on green areas, playgrounds, we have the Sunny Bank Park rangers and the Friends of Lynwood Gardens who protect the Sunny Bank [Park, located at the end of Broomhall Place and off Ecclessall Road in section C of Broomhall] and the Lynwood Gardens [located in the heart of the end of Dorset and Gloucester streets of section C of Broomhall and the end of Park Crescent of section D of Broomhall just behind the Aunt Sally pub], these parks may not be in danger to fall in the hands of developers, but others are like playgrounds which are used by many kids from long time residents of Broomhall, there are some Friends of the Playgrounds of Broomhall organizations holding on to playgrounds, but they seem to be losing them and they are being taking over by developers to build homes, business and so on."* [an information provider from section A of Broomhall] [I.P.02]

This respondent highlights these features as a conflictive issue between the residents who want to hold on to their open public and green land and the developers who want to take over that land for private Housing for Multiple Occupation (HMO), or the universities for teaching halls.

The next section presents, analyses, and discusses the information needs as emerged from the issues of territoriality or uses of the land.

5.2.1.2 INFORMATION NEEDS ABOUT TERRITORIALITY OR USES OF THE LAND

What are the community information needs related to the issues about *territoriality and uses of land?* From the evidence presented above these are interpreted by the author as follows:

- Working class residents renting in social housing need information to carry out some of these activities: 1) to know about their housing benefits entitlements; 2) to know about how to protect their homes against any security threats: crime, arson, robberies, vermin, etc.; 3) to know about how to protect their homes from any safety threats: e.g. smoke alarms (*Star (Sheffield),* (2004d); 4) to have a certainty that their homes will not be sold by the council or if they are going to be sold they need information to know all the legal proceedings of where, how and when the council is going to relocate them to new social housing; 5) working class residents do not have information needs related to the universities because whether or not these universities expand or not is basically of no consequence. Perhaps the only information need they may have may have to do with the possibility that their children may like to become students themselves and thus need information about scholarships or government loans for them to study. Some long-standing residents, like for example those from the Ruth Square & Broomspring Lane quarter which belongs to the University of Sheffield, wish they have access to information from the university or the government or both to know how to protect themselves from being evicted when the university sells the block of houses.

- Middle class residents need information to carry out some of these activities: 1) to know how to make refurbishments to their homes, e.g. obtain grants from the government; 2) to know how to protect themselves from the lobbies of both the government (included local councillors or MPs or MEPs) and housing capitalists in order to stop them from buying, or demolishing their properties; 3) to know all about these universities' expansionist plans in order to try to protect their properties from being bought, or demolished by the universities. Other secondary needs have to do with how to have some communication with universities' authorities in order to making them aware of certain nuisances being caused by their students, e.g. student life at night; students not collecting their rubbish bins, and so on.

- Capitalist class residents need information to carry out some of these activities: 1) to know how to buy more properties to develop them to offer them for rent or for sale as profitable Housing in Multiple Occupation (HMO); 2) to know how to lobby the government, e.g. in order to buy properties for example from conservation areas or restricted areas, or from citizens; 3) to know how to carry out jobs for the universities, e.g. building halls, flats, labs, research centres, etc. in order to maximise their profits.

The next section presents, analyses, and discusses the information provision about territoriality or uses of the land.

5.2.1.3 INFORMATION PROVISION ABOUT TERRITORIALITY OR USES OF THE LAND

The most pressing issues and thus information needs derived from them are related to *territoriality;* namely housing. Hence keeping abreast of all the information related to housing could be a matter of one day having roof and the next day being evicted:

> "The problem now in Broomhall today is that houses are too expensive for local people to buy them. That's the new problem. At one time it was not a desirable area and the houses were very cheap. And now they are very expensive. How they find information? [about housing] They can go to churches, they can go to libraries, they can read local newspapers. Local newspapers have quite lots of information." [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.04]

The most effective information provider on housing issues from the statutory sector is the Howden House of the Sheffield City Council.

> "The main issue of information in Broomhall is about housing, and people tend to go to First Point housing office in central town in Howden House. That's pretty good. You just can turn up and you can speak face to face with somebody and get information and there is a free phone there and you can phone free through somebody in the council [Sheffield City Council] so I think that they provide information." [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I.02]

However, when individuals have problems which cannot be sorted out by Howden House, they would go to the Sharrow Citizens Advice Bureau.

> "So it is not that "oh, I give you a bit of information on GSA," but also in all the housing issues involved, the housing benefits involved, if they notified their change of address and so and so. And what about if they have a disability, do they have a disability living allowance? We are very proactive in giving information to people rather than just passively responding to their queries." [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.05]

However another organisation acting somewhat like a Documental Information Institution (DII) considers that the SCAB does not satisfy all the advice, information, and help needs people face:

> "To give advice to people on legal matters and so on, you have to have trained people… a lot of what we end up doing is at very low level, but people need that support, they need support for school meals, filling forms for reception places, lots of our families need support on that, and the Citizens' Advice Bureau wouldn't do that, but sometimes other things happen as well, you know, we ring the housing associations, we make phone calls for people and that is something that the Citizens' Advice Bureau could be doing." [an information provider from section B of Broomhall] [I.P.07]

As has been argued throughout the thesis, social class is a determinant factor to having or not having access to information. For instance, most middle class residents would just telephone the agency on which information is needed:

> "There are lots of ways to find information, it depends on what we need, for example if it relates to housing, we just telephone the council..." [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 05]

It was found that Sheffield and Hallam universities only provide exclusive information, advice and help services for the members of their own communities but not for all city wide citizens.

> "The universities [University of Sheffield and Hallam University] have done very little to support Broomhall. The presence of the universities makes a huge impact in the community. If the universities wouldn't be here, not many students would come to live here, that makes a huge effect against the community." [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 08].

> "The universities [University of Sheffield and Hallam Sheffield University] are very important drivers of the Sheffield economy, but I question whether the money is spent in Broomhall, I would imagine is a tiny fraction." [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.05].

5.2.2 Information needs and provision relating to poverty and social, and economic inequalities

The sections here present, analyse, and discuss the issues, information needs, and provision relating to poverty, and social, and economic inequalities.

5.2.2.1 POVERTY, AND SOCIAL, AND ECONOMIC INEQUALITY ISSUES

This section presents, analyses, and discusses issues of poverty, and social, and economic inequalities. These include: a) the destitute, asylum seekers, and refugees, b) unemployment, c) debt, and d) crime.

5.2.2.1.1 The destitute, asylum seekers, and refugees

Poverty has been found as an endemic failure of the capitalist system (Green, 2000c; 2000a), and not only in present times, but also from history (Fearnley, 2001; Orwell, [1937], 1962; Engels, [1845], 2000). In the Britain of the 1830s and 1840s Victorian times, according to a Sheffield chronicler, "…the government of the day clearly classified poverty as a disease and not as an economic disaster incurred by a national recession" (Fearnley, 2001: 33). Some

may relegate this argument as a historic fact of no consequence for present times, or some may even find that writer biased.

However in recent times, poverty is still a big issue for many people, perhaps not at a national level, but at least in the poor and most overcrowded areas of Broomhall, like section A, and even with worse consequences for the destitute individuals who are not even entitled to any government social security benefits as an information provider explains:

> *"Unemployment is not only the big issue, there are people who can't even work at all, so they can't get a wage. And there are many people like this in the area [Broomhall, particularly on section A] who are not entitled to anything because the asylum system refused them, so they are what we call them destitute. They don't have any right for anything, no accommodation. There are many destitute people. And they [are] basically living on the good will of other people. And probably they are involved in crime and all of that if anyone maybe would do if they don't have any legal means for survival. So they have come here to us many destitute people but we can only give them a very limited referral to other legal institutions. You know there has been [by the government] a lot of restrictions on immigration. Personally I don't believe everyone is having a fair hearing, and then you have the situation… [of the destitute] it's very difficult to meet the asylum criteria [of the government] as it is. So they tell them to go back, but they are terrified to go back, but they can't go back because they are going to be killed by their husbands' family so that maybe won't fit the strict criteria of asylum, you know what I'm saying?" [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.05].*

The same commentator explains that most of the destitute in Broomhall, particularly from section A, are asylum seekers whom the government denied permission to remain in the UK. They are completely destitute entitled to no public or humanitarian social service.

> *"so I see a bigger issue of failure in the government, before asylum seekers had humanitarian protection and could remain for 3 or 4 years in the UK fully entitled to asylum rights waiting for the government to sort out their legal situation but not sending them back to their countries, but now I don't see the government is giving them any humanitarian protection. But if they claim for asylum they [government] have to give them almost immediately and they have the rights almost immediately. An under the Geneva Convention, any nation subscribing the Geneva Convention is supposed to provide asylum related to questions of violence and so on. And the UK subscribes this convention. But when they [the government] deny asylum to any one they are denying any kind of support for asylum seekers. … the requirements are very complex and stiff. … and I think that there are many cases where people are legitimately entitled for asylum right, but they [the government] denies it and therefore they become destitute …the major group of asylum seekers and refugees in Broomhall is the Somali community they came to join the pre-existing Somali community in Broomhall." [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.05].*

This argument shows how bigger political issues at the British national level affect the lives of the poor and the destitute at lower levels such as the poorest areas of Broomhall. There are also many social problems and issues related to poverty as a commentator explains (Green, 2000c; 2000a), for example, in Broomhall "there is a relationship of poverty and health" [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 08]. A poor working class resident on social benefits confirmed the above statements by suggesting that the government does not help the poor in the way they need it:

> *"There is nothing around here, there is nothing around here for the needy, the down and out, the alcoholics, the drug addicts, there is nothing for them to do, there is no way for them to go, and that's what we need. You know we know each other, we can work together, we know we can work together, but it's like, we need somebody, that's gonna say: 'yes, we're gonna*

do this' and not be fucked up like the council like happens all the time." [a working class resident from section A] [F.G.03.A].

Another poor working class resident on social benefits, in the same focus group interview, even argued that some people, in allusion to the government and some voluntary sector organisations, treated young people like animals (meaning animals in a clear pejorative and contemptuous way as being irrational):

> *"because if we start treating these youngers [sic] as human beings, and not as animals as some people think, then we might get some good, because you know we all are human beings."* [a working class resident from section A] [F.G.03.C].

Poverty was found in the poorest areas of sections A, B, and C of Broomhall, and particularly in section A as a "big issue, there are people in benefits, they don't have money" [an information provider from section D of Broomhall] [I.P.06]. "There are therefore features of deprivation, poverty, overcrowding" adds [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.05]. In the poorest areas of sections ABC, especially in A, thousands of people live overcrowded in the 494 flats of the Hanover Estates. And the same commentator argues that cheek by jowl, in section D, the Broomhall Park (BP), lives a "part of the community that is so well off, very privileged, cheek by jowl" [I.P.05]. However, the people from BP are not part of the Broomhall neighbourhood, at least not part of the sections A, B, and C of Broomhall. Poverty is not an issue for the people of section D, the BP.

5.2.2.1.2 Unemployment

As shown in Table 5.1 above there is a general consensus that unemployment is a major issue with pervasive negative consequences for the poor working classes of Broomhall. These are the perceptions of some residents and information providers:

> *"The first worst thing [in Broomhall] is unemployment and low income. There's not much employment in the area. The majority or the biggest percentage of the residents in Broomhall are unemployed."* [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.01].

> *"The major feature that describe this community is high unemployment. There is not enough work for people in this estate [Hanover Flats, Exeter Drive, Sheffield, S3]. There is nothing for the younger people to do so they go out and commit crime, because they get bored and that causes other problems."* [a working class respondent from section A] [F.G.03.A].

> *"definitively employment is an issue."* [an information provider from section B of Broomhall] [I.P.07]

One respondent commented on the lack of jobs and the lack of advice and information provision:

> *"There are not jobs. There is not advice about jobs or information."* [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.A].

Another respondent mentioned that many people lacked jobs and face difficulties raising their children:

"I think is by providing jobs, through jobs so these workers can get the skills, so these organizations need to come and encourage. You know many parents they don't have jobs and for raise their kids is difficult." [a working class respondent from section C] [F.G.01.D].

5.2.2.1.3 Debt

The author (Muela-Meza, 2005b), in a recent paper found that a Sheffield middle class citizen – however, not from Broomhall – committed suicide by hanging himself on the 28th of July 2003 because he had a debt with banks amounting to more than £ 70, 000 pounds through 19 credit cards, several of them issued by the same bank, when he only earned £ 22, 000 pounds a year. The author (Muela-Meza, 2005b) questioned if more effective institutionalised provision of information, advice and help would have prevented this man from killing himself.

"But there is also a lot of debt in the area, due to unemployment, due to multiculturalism, and due to drugs, and drunk [sic] behaviour. That is always involved, so you need those things, you need unemployment, a good... [sic, pause] and debt as part of the area. People get to debt because because [sic double because] they have to pay basic needs and money just isn't enough, you need… there isn't enough money for their basic needs. You know, if they already smoke, or they already drink, they are not going to stop, they going to do that anyway." [a working class resident from section A] [F.G.03.A].

5.2.2.1.4 Crime

Crime is one of the major issues found in this research, but not as a causal agent affecting other issues of this report, but rather as effect of the direct or tangential effects of others like poverty.

A respondent gives a rather positive account of crime in Broomhall and Broomhill:

"there is not much crime against the person, but against properties, cars, homes, and students are very vulnerable because they bring computers and all kind of fancy things and they get stolen. So that's one of the constant problem of living in this kind of area high incidence of crimes." [an information provider from Broomhill] [I.P.03].

However those impressions do not match with the news from the press. On 10 August 2006 a writer and businessman was knifed in intended robbery on Victoria Road, section D, the Park of Broomhall:

"A brave dad today told how he tackled robbers who held him at knifepoint outside his Sheffield home. John Malcomson was attacked by two men as he placed his wheelie bin outside his house at Victoria Road, Broomhall. But he escaped with cuts to his hands, arms and leg as he wrestled the knife from one of his assailants on Tuesday evening" (*Star (Sheffield), 2006a).*

On 20 September 2004 a university lecturer was robbed at knifepoint on section D, the Park, Broomhall:

"A lecturer was robbed on a Sheffield street by two men who held a blade to his throat. The 53 year old was followed by two men as he walked home from the city centre last night and they struck in Clarkegrove Road, Broomhall." (*Star (Sheffield), 2004a)*

An old lady was also attacked and robbed in section D, the Park, Broomhall, like the recent robbery and attack on an old lady who died afterwards in hospital:

An 80 years old "woman suffered injuries to her face, hands and legs after her handbag was snatched on Collegiate Crescent, Broomhall. The thug fled towards Ecclesall Road with the bag. He was in his early 20s, stocky, of medium height and wearing a dark anorak" (*Star (Sheffield), 2006e).*

Making self complacent stereotypes about the types of criminals and crimes do not describe comprehensively the phenomena.

Drug dealing crimes are the most common in Broomhall. Between 2005 and 2006 several cannabis factories were seized (BBC News (Sheffield), 2005b; 2006). But there has been a fatal crime against Mohammed Abdu Razak Abdullahi, a Somali 19 year old man, who was killed by having been thrown to the ground from the 9th floor of the Hanover Flats on section D of Broomhall, Exeter Drive (BBC News (Sheffield), 2004; 2005a; 2006; *Star (Sheffield), 2004c).*

There have been not only attacks on the person, but also violently with fire arms (BBC News (Sheffield), 2007; Star (Sheffield)*, 2007d).* Arson crimes are very common in different multi occupant housing, like the Hanover Flats on Exeter Drive, section A of Broomhall. In 2004 a flat was set on fire in an arson attack through the letter box and the owner died of smoke intoxication (*Star (Sheffield), 2004d).* A mentally unstable person murdered Mrs. Ali by arson attack on her flat (Star (Sheffield)*, 2005a).*

Therefore, in the respondent's opinion painting a positive picture of the security of the area is fine. He has the right to imagine we live in the most secure and happy world. But in the case of the police minimizing crime it is a different story, because police are supposed to be there to protect the public before crimes occur, not after. Thus these crimes show evidence of the failures of police and leave people deprived from their right to a safe environment from crime.

"the police are to a larger extent it's always as if they don't want to do the job, we had something on the street, a house that was occupied, and it was growing large amounts of weed, basically, and it smelled, it stunk, they might have had 4 crops a year, and the whole of the house was like a greenhouse basically, and... and... people told the police. Nothing we can't do about it. Well why don't you just pass by and have a smell, because you can smell it, it's obvious, at some point you'll feel the smell so bad and don't know which house is coming from because is so strong to the whole of the street, you smell it and gee was really bad. Eventually, eventually after a year, a year, they were forced, because someone phoned up, and forced them to actually do something about it because someone phoned someone higher up, and the police were caught with their trousers down [sic, and respondent laughs] basically, they went, they went to the letterbox, and it was so... so in your face, they had to do something, you know it was an embarrassment [for the police] feel like embarrassed, embarrassed to do the job [police job against drug dealing], it is almost as if they [the police] don't want to do the job [a working class resident from section A] [R.I. 07]."

Nevertheless, the same respondent mentions that the police have been less racist than in previous years:

"and they [the police] don't want to do the job, and now and then when things got so bad, there'll be a raid and things will settle down, then they can go back to square, and it's being like that all the time since I've live in Broomhall, I mean... it used to be the police more racist I must say" [a working class resident from section A] [R.I. 07].

The next section presents, analyses, and discusses the information needs that emerged from the issues about poverty, and social, and economic inequalities.

What are the community information needs related to poverty, social, and economic inequalities? Based on the evidence presented above, there follows a discussion of the community information needs, as interpreted by the author.

- Working class individuals need information to carry out these activities: 1) to know about their entitlements such as jobseeker allowance, asylum seeker allowance, single parent allowance, etc.; 2) to know how to find jobs; 3) to know how to cope with debt; 4) to know how to cope with crime, e.g. how to deal with the police in both cases, if they are victims or crime or if they allegedly committed crime; 5) basically to know about all the necessary things to allow them to maintain themselves above the "accepted" social standards of poverty, and to prevent them from falling beyond those standards into extreme poverty, thus becoming an even heavier burden for society. Otherwise they may fall pray of crime; or of negligent abandonment of statutory social care; or commit suicide; or killing others (*Star (Sheffield),* 2005a), etc. in order to overcome their extreme poverty condition. Thus, poor working class people will need information to know about things, only when there is still a chance for them to know, either because they are literate, or because they are able to speak for themselves in order to empower themselves. There are many cases where individuals are in an extreme poverty condition where they face the most severe mental disorders possibly due in part to extreme poverty conditions and other factors, and cannot know or find information for themselves. There is also scientific evidence that poverty is correlated with malnutrition due to the lack of nutrients such as iron on the regular diet. People lacking sufficient iron might develop anaemia, and consequently they will develop cognitive disorders for life, where even in the most positive teaching conditions they would never learn like normal individuals. Thus they will be cognitively crippled for life (Sagan, 1997; Heap, 2003; Muela-Meza, 2004b). These findings are particularly interesting because they challenge the validity of previous research. For example, Moore's (2002) model of social information needs emphasizes that "people with low levels of literacy absorbs less information than others with high literacy levels because so much of it is presented as text" (2002: 301). Whilst Moore's (2002: 301) assertion is valid, his model, nevertheless, fails to analyse the causes of people's limitations to absorb information behind his statement of the lack of literacy. He fails to correlate poverty and cognitive disorders caused by poverty found in this project as a realistic and materially rooted cause to explain why people cannot satisfy better their information needs.

- Middle class individuals need information either to try to understand the poverty phenomenon of their housing neighbours (e.g. from section B) in order to protect themselves from poor people in the case of criminals, or to try to help them to solve their problems. Although the evidence shown above indicates that basically they use information to protect themselves from the negative effects poor people present to them and their properties, rather than to help them to solve their problems, in some cases they worsen their

condition; e.g. attempting to ban prostitution (Hall, 1981), attempt to ban noisy pubs (*Star (Sheffield),* 2006f).

- The capitalist classes also need information to try to understand poor people, but more specifically to avoid the risks they represent to their capitalist businesses. For instance, since the territorial features had over-arching impacts on residents, in most cases capitalist housing developers have bluntly excluded the poor in their development plans and mentioned that the property market middle class and the more affluent (e.g. capitalist class) classes are the targets of their businesses, such as the upper market West One (see location in Figure 4.5 in Chapter 4 above or in *Broomhall News,* 2006: 4*,* and see pictures at Muela-Meza, 2003-2007). As a capitalist developer commented in relation to the West One complex: "we knew our target audience was going to be upper-market" (Blandy and Parsons, 2004: 12). They also challenged and lobbied and in the end circumvented, in the view of the author as he interpreted the data, the legal provisions from the government to provide "social housing" or "mixed tenure" and other protections for the poor working classes (Cabinet Office, 2001). In the view of the author, they screened out and rejected poor working class applicants, and if they did not reject them from the outset, they built expensive accommodation for middle and capitalist classes. The poor working classes, in the view of the author, were rejected by default since they could never afford to live there, e.g. in West One (Blandy, & Parsons, 2004). Poor working classes could never afford to live either in similar brand new upper-market developments around Sheffield city centre and Broomhall such as: Velocity Village, Cutlery Works, Fulcrum, AG1, Butcher Works, Cornish Square and City Walk developed by Blundells Ltd.'s *Centro* (*Exposed*, 2007: 22-23) or Finnegan Ltd.'s One Eleven (see location in Figure 4.5 in Chapter 4 above or in *Broomhall News,* 2006: 4*)* just across Ecclesall Road off the Hanover Flats, which redeveloped the ex Ward's Brewery and is even larger Blundells' West One.

The reader just needs to compare the pictures (see Muela-Meza, 2003-2007) of the Hanover Flats of section A (Sheffield City Council social housing particularly for poor working classes, destitute, asylum seekers, refugees, and other highly deprived groups) with the high middle and capitalist class developments like West One off the road from section B and One Eleven or Velocity just off the road from section A, and they will confirm that the high middle and capitalist class market developments have excluded completely poor working class residents, even at the slightest glimpse of their exterior design. For instance, Fulcrum development "is so good that even the architects who designed it have moved in downstairs" (*Exposed*, 2007: 22).

The next section presents, analyses, and discusses the ways in which information providers tried to meet the information needs that emerged from the issues about poverty, and social, and economic inequalities.

5.2.2.3   INFORMATION PROVISION RELATING TO POVERTY, AND SOCIAL, AND ECONOMIC INEQUALITIES

A LIS researcher found, in an MA dissertation at the Department of Information Studies at the University of Sheffield (Johnson, 1995), that there was a strong

connection between unemployment and social needs, being the most critical of them information, help and advice to help them know their entitlements and statutory rights and untangle the maze of statutory sector institutions. She argued that unemployment in the UK grew from one million to three million from 1981 to 1982 which took place as an effect of the Thatcher regime's steamroller of privatization of public services, cuts in welfare benefits, decline of steel industries, and so on (Johnson, 1995). "The work of advice centres therefore became more nominated by welfare rights work and many local authorities began to establish benefits advice services, often as part of an 'anti-poverty initiative.' … From the eighties onwards information and advice services have faced new demands of an increasingly depressing nature as a result of the contraction of the welfare state and cuts in public spending, leaving more and more people with inadequate or no means of support…" (Johnson, 1995: 4). This fact is corroborated by the perceptions of residents:

> *"One of the major issues is jobs. There are not jobs. There are not advice about jobs or information. Also drugs, people don't find other way to get money." [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.A].*

> *"We have a credit union to help people, but it's more about education financially. And we have a tenants' association, but people don't have confidence with either." [a working class resident from section A] [F.G.03.B].*

> *"also we are bombarded with information, you know people have televisions, we're bombarded with information, you go out on the street and there's adverts everywhere, our society is quite in new face, isn't? It gives the false impression that everything is available all you have to do is to have money, if you have it you can get anything, but if you don't, then you find the ways to get the money, that's what they do, but it isn't necessarily to get a job... they resort to crime..." [a working class resident from section A] [R.I. 07].*

5.2.3 Issues, information needs, and provision related to health

The sections here below present, analyse, and discuss the issues, information needs, and provision relating to health issues.

5.2.3.1 HEALTH ISSUES

It was found in historic documents that British poor people, working classes and the destitute of the 19th and mid 20th century suffered severe deprivation of health services (Engels, [1845], 2000; Orwell, [1937], 1962; Fearnley, 2001) . A Sheffield chronicler, (Fearnley, 2001), who spent his childhood in a social care hospice, and who conducted historical research into the living conditions of poor people, the working class, and the destitute who were confined to the workhouses hospices in Sheffield in Victorian times, the 1800s, found a cruel and crude reality where the poor, the destitute, and the pauper [sic] were punished for being paupers [sic] and he argued that they were treated by the authorities and workhouses carers with "sheer brutality", and despised by society, specially under the Poor Law of 1839 (Fearnley, 2001: 37). Being in care himself as a child, his accounts may appear to some extent biased by his own experiences. However, there are other accounts of the living conditions of the poor, and the working class people in Victorian England, and they do not differ from his. For instance Engels ([1845], 2000), in his book *The Condition of the Working Class in England: From Personal Observation and Authentic*

Sources written in 1845, also depicted the paupers [sic] living in the most miserable conditions even worse than criminal prisoners:

> "The food of criminal prisoners is better, as a rule, so that the paupers frequently commit some offence for the purpose of getting into jail. For the workhouse is a jail too; he who does not finish his task gets nothing to eat; he who wishes to go out must ask permission, which is granted or not, according to his behaviour or the inspectors whim; tobacco is forbidden, also the receipt of gifts from relatives or friends outside the house; the paupers wear a workhouse uniform, and are handed over, helpless and without redress, to the caprice of the inspectors" (Engels, [1845], 2000).

People today may dismiss these arguments and consider them an historical account not applicable to current times. They may also even argue that such episodes of extreme deprivation do not exist in current times. However, nowadays there are still cases of extreme deprivation of health services provision, but taking place in different ways than those of Victorian times. The times have changed, but in both periods extreme deprivation of health services has taken place.

For instance, cases were found in this project where people under care have been deprived of adequate health provision, like for example the case of a victim of some careless staff from the private social care South Yorkshire Housing Association 911 Project charity located in Broomhall: "a chronic drinker was found dead in bed at a Sheffield residential home after night support workers failed to spot she was dying of alcohol poisoning" (*Star (Sheffield),* 2006b). This victim whose care staff thought she was "sleeping it off" died there at the SYHA 911 Project charity, South Yorkshire HA Care and Supported Housing, at 9-11 Filey Street, section C of Broomhall, Sheffield, S10 2FF.

Certainly this is only one case of alleged negligence committed by this private health care institution and generalizations cannot be drawn from this. Nor can this be rigorously compared with the condition of the destitute in Victorian workhouses. However, by the simple fact that this case has happened, provided that *The Star* could be taken as a true and reliable information source, it may be symptomatic of the condition of other people under care. It is arguably symptomatic of a current kind of neglect the people of our times are experiencing. And this is particularly true for Broomhall where many people with alcohol related diseases are being taken care of in places like SYHA. Many more go to Broomhall from other sides of Sheffield to have free meals provided by Christian people at the Hanover Methodist Church, Broomspring Lane, or at the Sunnybank Community Centre, Williams Street, both in section C. A working class resident perceives social care neglect in these terms:

> *"I see all these drunk people sitting by CostCutter, here by Broomhall Street, [section C] and it is very sad and they live their lives of themselves and they are outcast by the community and generally everyone just ignores them and that is sad." [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.A].*

Apparently those Christian people feed the drinkers and other people out of disinterested charity. However other working class respondents perceive that such help has hidden intentions or agendas in trying to convert people to Christianity, or Islam, or become followers of their churches:

> *"St. Thomas, the church is in Crookes, but they serve in the Sunny Bank Community. […] but that's the problem with all religions, you can say the same for Muslims, quite of few people*

who teach the children, the Koran, but behind it all again like the Jesus Army stands where they want to convert them, you know, bring them into their religion, and they are quite a few." [a working class resident from section A] [R.I. 07].

"So it is like indoctrination, like bringing more people in, but that is not doing something for the community. Whereas the Methodist Church [Hanover, at Broomspring Lane, section C] they do things because they see as a need, sometimes they may suffer because there is a need as they see a need, they will feed the drinker, and the drinker will come and spend the time in Broomhall, so we have a problem with the street drinkers here, by the CostCutter [at Broomhall Road in the corner of Williams Street]." [a working class resident from section A] [R.I. 07].

Another resident agrees with resident R.I.07's perceptions:

"the Jesus Army don't do anything for the community, they just try to convert people to Christianise and to love God [a working class resident from section B of Broomhall]." [R.I. 10]

The comments of respondents 07 and 10 just mentioned shed light on broader issues related to health. Both of them provide a strong argument relating to how the negligence of government, private and voluntary sectors relating to adequate health services provision has to be compensated for by religious people and churches. Furthermore, 07 highlights another aspect of the problem: Broomhall has a severe problem of drinkers on the streets, in particular in sections C, A, and B (but not D), because those religious people and churches attract them to feed and indoctrinate them. But religious people and churches fail to criticise the causes of this problem.

Religious people and churches, either disinterestedly or for indoctrination purposes, play a great role in attracting many drinkers and drug addicts to the Broomhall neighbourhood, and hence increasing the security and health risks of residents, and particularly of children. At best, they cause nuisances, but at worst they throw away drug needles on the streets or in children's playgrounds. This is a big social problem and issue for the people in the neighbourhood, because within the neighbourhood there is already a big problem of alcoholism and drug addiction. Hence religious people and churches, by simply feeding alcohol and drug abusers –either by honest charity or indoctrination-- without criticising the government's health policies, become part of the problem.

There are other cases in the press of alleged victims of health care neglect. For example Michael Wilkinson, according to the press, "has cerebral palsy but has lost two of his regular carers 15 months ago within weeks of each other - throwing his life into disarray. But he says over the past few years employing a carer has become a nightmare. In order to live as full a life as possible Michael needs to have a carer to help him with general household chores. But he has grown increasingly frustrated at the difficulty of finding reliable and considerate employees" (*Star (Sheffield), 2005e).* According to the charity Scope, specialist in cerebral palsy, much of the blame for Mr. Wilkinson's problems is due to the fact that the government changed the funding rules for disabled people and now they can buy their own care, but Scope argues that this would put more stress and difficulties on patients as in Mr. Wilkinson's case (*Star (Sheffield), 2005e).*

Another dramatic example of alleged health care neglect is the case of 61 year old Somali grandmother Amina Ali who "died in an arson blaze because a paranoid schizophrenic did not receive the correct treatment. Abdirisak Hussein [another Somali] started a blaze which killed Amina Ali just hours after pleading

for help from a social worker in the street" (Star (Sheffield), 2005a). Mrs. Ali died in her flat at Cliff Street, maisonettes flats in Sharrow which are located just across the road off Ecclesall Road and near the Hanover Flats. This fatal example did not take place actually within the working boundaries of this thesis, but it is arguably relevant to this study of Broomhall, since according to the press, the murderer of Mrs. Ali threatened many times at the Broomhall Sunny Bank Community Centre (section C) Mrs. Ali's husband because he belonged to the Black Adam Tribe in Somalia. It is also reported that he pleaded for mental health care at the Hanover Medical Centre, but he was not served; or at least as seen from these fatidic facts he was not served well. The defence alleged that if he would have been given adequate mental treatment and medication he might not have killed Mrs. Ali (Star (Sheffield), 2005a).

This is a very sad example of health care neglect, and whilst nothing will justify this murder's act, the arguments of his defence have some weight. Nevertheless, this murder case is too complex to be attributed solely to medical factors. Conflicts based on tribalism are the other side of this case. Some respondents made comments about this:

> "I don't like people talking about tribes, I don't like it much." [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.C].

Another respondent elaborates on this idea:

> "You know what she wants to say is that... You know that is what I like about England is that no one asks you about tribes and that is something very good even among Somali here. You know in our country no one can marry any one from other tribes because they put first the tribes and they don't marry people from other tribes even if you are beautiful or rich. So I think here that the young generations we are happy here, but in our country is very bad because of the tribalism." [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.B].

Thus, the alleged mental disorders of Mrs. Ali's murderer are one side of the story; his tribalism is another side, and certainly there may be some or many other sides. But another resident suggests that the fragmentation of Somali people back home due to their civil war might have been brought to the UK as they came here as asylum seekers fleeing from war:

> "the other thing is fragmentation you may be aware of conflicts among the Somali community after all the Somali community arrived after the civil war so, I am presuming people from more than one side in the civil war are here." [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 01].

This respondent's opinion gives another view of the possible issues behind Mrs. Ali's murder. Perhaps the British policies on asylum seeking and refugees not only have adverse effects on the people being refused, namely the destitute, but also on the people being accepted. These issues show some evidence that British policies, related to integrating asylum seekers and refugees as British citizens entitled to all the wide coverage of social services are very limited.

These fatidic cases of health service provision neglect provide some evidence that the authorities' responsibilities do not stop at granting people permission to stay in the country; it should be the authorities' responsibilities at all levels – central, local, voluntary – to assure that all newcomers become adapted to British culture.

Certainly all newcomers to a new culture have their responsibilities to adapt to the new culture. But this should be a reciprocal flow or adaptation: the newcomers should adapt to British culture, and the British culture should be tolerant with the newcomers' culture. The British authorities and public servants have the responsibility to understand all the diverse cultural backgrounds of the people who live in their country and who like themselves and everybody else, also need be served by all the gamut of services they need to survive and have a happy, peaceful and prosperous life.

Nevertheless, a caveat is necessary here. After all has been said above, this thesis could not provide a sound critique of the British government by simply analysing the cases found above in the press. Nor can broad generalizations be drawn.

5.2.3.1.1 Lack of health due to lack of public green open space

Territoriality or uses of the land have a strong relation with health. More clearly the lack of health facilities has been found to have a strong connection with the lack of healthy lifestyles in Broomhall. Observation suggested that since most of the land is being privatised for upper-market Housing in Multiple Occupancy (HMO), which most of the poor working class (and some lower middle class) residents could not afford, this privatisation phenomenon has brought at the same time the problem that most of the health and sport facilities affordable for poor working classes have been replaced by upper-market ones (see for instance hundreds of photographs which show evidence of this at Muela-Meza, 2003-2007). Two residents from section C support this idea:

> *"public green space is under provided in Broomhall according to the council records, I don't know how precisely they define Broomhall for the purpose of compiling those statistics but they say there is under provision. And I really think there is under provision if you contemplate the density of houses in Exeter of twin tower flats [section A]... so there are 256 flats in each tower..."* [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 01].

> *"There are very little green open spaces for everyone. There is an allotment around here but there are only 20 plots and some people have more than two lots. And as for gardens some people got almost nothing and there are some others with very big gardens, it varies a lot. And the houses with multiple occupation don't have any gardens.... people from Broomhall use Devonshire park."* [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 04].

One respondent mentioned that there is a lack of parks and playgrounds for all the people and children:

> *"No, the building developers, they come in to do student accommodation, modernising building, but they don't regenerate the parks. Around here there are lots of children around here, and when it comes to holidays they are just walking around the streets, but if there would be something constructive like parks where they would go, so there wouldn't be broken glass, no needles [used by drug addicts], it would be nice for parks. The developers they don't do anything, I think they don't."* [a working class respondent from section C] [F.G.01.B].

There is only one playground on Hanover Street and another smaller one around the Hanover Flats, but they are not enough and they look rather old, with some benches semi-derelict.

> *"The playground may be enough for younger children, but for older children there is a quite a lot of pressure... there is a great competition between spaces for university students and to older children from the community."* [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 04]

5.2.3.1.2 Lack of health due to lack of free, or affordable sport facilities

Poor health is associated with a lack of engagement in sport and fitness activity. The latter was corroborated by respondents' perceptions and by observation. A lack of health was perceived as due to a lack of free or affordable sport facilities as these respondents note:

> *"there is a big issue in Sheffield to sports facilities because they are very expensive."* [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 06].

> *"there are many leisure facilities, theatres, cinemas, swimming pools, and so on, but you have to pay for access."* [a working class resident from section A] [R.I. 07].

"the worst is that there are not affordable facilities for recreation, you know sports, and recreation, there is Ponds Forge swimming pool but it's too expensive and people here cannot afford it [meaning from sections A, B, and C of Broomhall], or if you want to go to the cinema is not cheap." [an information provider from section B of Broomhall] [I.P.07].

"You know, there is [sic] no youth clubs. We don't have nothing [sic]. We don't have any advice centre." [a working class resident from section A] [F.G.03.C].

But this lack of free and affordable health and sport facilities in Broomhall is a recent phenomenon, because even in the very recent past, Broomhall used to be better served with free or affordable facilities. And this fact is even corroborated by a middle class resident:

"but it would be very nice to have here in Broomhall a healthy living centre so they don't need to go all the way up to Upperthorpe to swimming pool and gym there is more cheaper, and you know if you want to join a gym you need to pay a yearly subscription and many people around here, including ourselves could not afford to pay a subscription to have access on an occasional basis, so it would be nice to have a centre like Upperthorpe, you know they have a library, a cafe, and a swimming pool, and they have classes and I think that would be great, whereas, yes there are gyms around here but used by a very select number of people, and that is great. It would be great if we have something like Upperthorpe. We used to have Glossop Road baths and they shut them down there was a swimming pool there just across the carriageway for it is not longer there. And it would be good if one of the universities [of Sheffield and Hallam Sheffield] would put something back in the community and even if the university opened up their own facilities at a reasonable rate, and they opened it, but again, they are too expensive. And Hallam [Hallam Sheffield University] haven't got any good facilities any way." [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 06].

Thus, if even a middle class resident complains about the lack of sport facilities or the expensive fees to access them, then it could be inferred that for poor working classes on benefits, not to mention the destitute, access to these facilities is impossible.

Furthermore, there is particularly one health and sport facility missing in Broomhall, especially missing for the poorest working classes: the Sheffield YMCA (Young Men's Christians Association). As shown in Table 5.1 in this chapter, the YMCA has emerged as one of the most negative issues affecting the residents of Broomhall. Many interviewees complained that since 2001 when they sold their facilities on Broomhall Road, (section D, the Park), to Sheffield Hallam University (SHU) (Star (Sheffield), 2002b), they have been deprived of free and affordable access to 10, 956 square metres of sport facilities (gym, pitches, and other services where people did aerobics, weightlifting, health exercise, yoga, training and many other healthy activities). This was much used and needed, particularly by poor people. To give an idea of the massiveness of 10, 956 m2 of the ex-YMCA property on Broomhall Road compared with the twin towers of Hanover Flats, of section A which is only 1,155 m2, see Table 4.6 (in Chapter 4).

Thus, most of the respondents, working and middle class residents and information providers alike, criticised the YMCA for this sale and consequent deprivation.

"for leisure facilities, the YMCA used to have a gym I think it was at Victoria Road or Collegiate Crescent [it was located on Broomhall Road actually] but they sold it to the Sheffield University [actually to Sheffield Hallam University Broomhall campus] and this university demolished it and built formal classroom type buildings, I'm not sure what they

built as a replacement. And that was a quite cheap gym [the YMCA] many people used to use and now is gone, so that is something they can't use any more." [an information provider from section A] [I.P.08].

"There are quite some private companies which have set gyms one called Greens at walking distances, literally just opposite to Waitrose you know what I mean? But again, it's private and it's quite expensive. So my guess is that people used the YMCA and now [since the YMCA sold the property to Sheffield Hallam University] don't use anywhere [sic]." [an information provider from section A] [I.P.08].

"I know there is a Somali football team but there is no pitch to play in Broomhall, I think they go to play to the nearest pitch which in the General Cemetery." [an information provider from section A] [I.P.08].

The YMCA sold to the Sheffield Hallam University the massive land on Broomhall Road where the gym mentioned above used to be. See table 5.9 below to find the *Comparative ground areas in square metres of the ex YMCA properties on Broomhall Road (section D) and the ex St. Silas Church (section C).* In this table the reader will find that the ex YMCA premises on Broomhall Road (section D) were 24 times bigger than the new ones they bought on the ex St. Silas Church (section C) where they plan to serve Broomhall from sections A, B, and C.

Table 5.9 Comparative ground areas in square metres of the ex YMCA properties on Broomhall Road (section D) and ex St. Silas Church (section C)	
Area of ex YMCA property on Broomhall Road	Area of new YMCA property on ex St. Silas Church
10, 956 m2 (132 m frontage per 83 m depth)	450 m2 (15 m frontage per 30 m depth)

The developers destroyed the YMCA, the Solar and all of that area, but not to build flats. Some data from the literature illustrate this. The developers destroyed the YMCA, but they have built a multi million pound development for the School of Health and Social Care of the Sheffield Hallam University (SHU):

"The School of Health and Social Care is to have a new purpose-built home with state-of-the-art facilities that will enable it to provide the very best in training for the next generation of health professionals. Due for completion in September 2004, the multi-million pound development of the former YMCA building site on Broomhall Road will ensure Sheffield Hallam is well placed to meet the Government's radical agenda for tackling the national healthcare recruitment crisis" (Sheffield Hallam University Alumni Association, 2003: 9).

This news does not mention at all that the Sheffield Hallam University will create any alternative facilities for the free use of the community as the YMCA used to offer. That is, clearly this university has destroyed the only health and fitness centre the Broomhall residents used to have, but at the same time it has built other facilities which will prepare the health scientists and practitioners to cope with health problems at a higher level. This evidences a twofold problem: on the one side they adversely affect the health of the community, but on the other hand they are investing in their future provision of health services that will contribute to the health of all, not only for Broomhall residents. Nevertheless, this study did not find any evidence relating to whether, or how, Sheffield Hallam University will provide alternative fitness facilities to the community. This study aims just to present the facts as perceived by residents.

"I used to go to the YMCA gym but Hallam [Hallam Sheffield University] demolished it, I used to go there and make lots of friends there a long time ago, there used to be many things there, but you know Hallam demolished it and built a new building there for their students...

you know, I think it is part of the erosion of local facilities, maybe I'm a bit sentimental but you know all over Sheffield there used to be a network of swimming baths and there are very very [sic, double "very"] few left now." [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 06].

5.2.3.1.3 Health issues related to drugs

Drug issues have dramatic effects on all the people involved and even on innocent non-involved people, but mainly on drug addiction victims who are victims of the illegal drug dealing crime or sheer poverty and statutory social care neglect. Drug issues have relations to many other issues. However this project did not delve into the manifold causes or effects because the author is not expert in medicine or other health related disciplines, and because that goes beyond the scope of this project. Nevertheless, this project does indeed show evidence that drug issues are perhaps the most adverse issues affecting not only the victims, but also many other people. Next are presented some discussions from residents and information providers of what they perceive to be the causes of drug addiction in Broomhall.

A working class respondent associates the problem of drug addiction with unemployment:

"The main cause for drugs problem is unemployment, if people had jobs they wouldn't be in drugs..." [a working class resident from section A] [F.G.03.B].

On similar lines as respondent F.G.03.B, another respondent argues that poverty or unemployment may drive people not to become drug addicts, but drug dealers:

"There is definitively a drug issue in this area for easy money and a lot of families are very worried in their families that their older sons get into drugs or as drug dealers, you know is easy money, but we are always encouraging them with education of the dangers of those issues. There are needles in the yard. There is prostitution; we have found evidences of prostitution in our playgrounds and car parks." [an information provider from section B of Broomhall] [I.P.07].

This invites the question of why drug addiction is not alleviated, or dealt with properly by statutory health care provision.

A working class resident complains that there are no drug rehabilitation institutions free of charge for drug addicts:

"We need a drug rehabilitation house free of charge for all the people around here, we don't have any." [a working class resident from section A] [F.G.03.C].

There are some drug rehabilitation institutions in Broomhall, but these are not statutory, but private such as Phoenix House in section D, the Park. It is evident that in section A many people have severe health problems caused by alcoholism, drug addiction, and other factors, and across the road, in section D, the Park, there is the Phoenix House institution that could help them, or the Counselling Services of the University of Sheffield, in Wilkinson Street, section C. But in both cases they are private and exclusive institutions, the first serving only people from a middle or capitalist class background, and the second only members of the university community.

Another working class resident agrees with respondent *[F.G.03.C]* above and complains that there are no drug rehabilitation institutions. This respondent also emphasizes that drug addiction is a larger social public issue which is not addressed properly:

> *"…another issue is drug addicts because society divide them, separate them for no reason, but drug issue is not an issue on its own, it isn't, the people who takes drugs don't come in one group, they don't come in one category, you know drug users come not only from poor houses, they come from all over, they come from different nationalities, you have Asian people who take drugs, black people, men and women who take people, young people who take drugs, all people who take drugs, people religious take drugs, you know what I mean? There are no boundaries, and society tries to put them as they don't happen and put them in a little box..." [a working class resident from section A] [R.I. 09].*

Another problem that drug addiction brings to people is that the private companies have to provide health care for drug addicts and their families. Due to the severe circumstances they are experiencing they then become a heavier burden for other social services providers, as one respondent comments:

> *"it's really hard, we also have drug rehabilitation unit, hostel, homeless accommodations on the other side [section D of Broomhall], and those children come here [Springfield Primary School, section B], so we have quite a lot different area of those very affected families. That's the Phoenix house, their children come here [to Springfield Primary School] and there these women hostels where their kids arrive in a dreadful state and those homeless accommodations and their kids come here, so those problems are completely different! [sic] here, you know, they come [the children] with lots of emotional problems, and we have to do the job of psychologists, social workers, and we can't hire psychologists because we don't have the money. It's very expensive." [an information provider from section B of Broomhall] [I.P.07]*

The next section presents, analyses, and discusses the information needs that emerged from health issues.

5.2.3.2 INFORMATION NEEDS RELATED TO HEALTH ISSUES

What are the community information needs related to health issues? To summarise the evidence presented above, these are the following.

- All social classes need information to know how to improve their health, e.g. about their corresponding GP, a particular health provider or service for their particular illnesses, etc.
- Working class residents particularly need information to: 1) to know about their health benefits entitlements; and 2) to cope with alcohol and drug addiction.
- Capitalist and middle class residents need information to cope with alcohol and drug addiction.

The next section presents, analyses, and discusses the ways in which information providers tried to meet the information needs that emerged from the issues related to health.

5.2.3.3 INFORMATION PROVISION RELATED TO HEALTH ISSUES

Residents complain that there is no provision related to health issues.

"The way to break these circles [lack of health facilities or poverty] is by bringing in those advice bureaux and youth clubs, I think the youth clubs will be fantastic, a place where people can come, and talk to someone and get some advice, you know like those places of the Sunny Bank people come from all over Sheffield and those people feed them, and that's nice, but if there would be a place where they can also listen to them and help them with their drug, job and other problems." [a working class resident from section A] [F.G.03.E]

However as shown above in Tables 5.4 through 5.9, there is provision of health information, advice, and help through the Hanover Medical Centre (HMC). There is an extension service every Tuesday at the HMC from the Sharrow's Citizens Advice Bureau (SCAB). But the problem is that people want information, advice, and help services within Broomhall boundaries.

5.2.4 Issues, information needs, and provision related to politics

The sections below present, analyse, and discuss the issues, information needs, and provision relating to politics.

5.2.4.1   POLITICAL ISSUES

Politics are the thorniest issues found in this project, because it is where the social class struggle concept unfolds bringing to the surface the powerful dominating classes (capitalist and middle) and their negative effects against the weak dominated ones (working). Thus, a major organisation as described above in Table 5.1 emerged as the most negative political issue affecting the community: the Broomhall Forum (BF).

The main conflict derived from the BF has to do with funding. The BF since its foundation in 1998 has been acting as a self imposed umbrella organisation obtaining large amounts of funding from the European Union, the UK central government, regional government, and the Sheffield City Council amongst many other voluntary sources. Once they have obtained the money they have become a sort of mini "city council" within Broomhall and they unilaterally have self-assumed a role perceived by residents as dangerous because they decide who they fund and who they do not and they are not publicly accountable before any authority.

5.2.4.1.1 The Broomhall Forum (BF)

The Broomhall Forum has been perceived by residents as a non accountable organisation and they distrust it:

"The Forum should be a public accountable group [Broomhall Forum, located and acting inside the offices of the Sheffield YMCA at 7 Broomgrove Road, Sheffield, S10 2LW, section D of Broomhall], it is in the process of doing it but it should do it better." [a working class resident from section A] [R.I. 09].

Some others perceive it as an organisation that does not provide funding for all the people of Broomhall when it is needed. A working class resident complains that the Broomhall Forum denied funding to a BME (Black Minority Ethnic) organisation of Broomhall in 2004:

"This one [organisation's name omitted] centre applied for funding for the Broomhall Forum but it was denied funding. And this is the only black minority centre in the south of Sheffield

and it was denied funding. It is Black Minority Ethnic organizations, BME." [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.A].

A member of that organisation supported the perception of respondent F.G.02.A:

"The problem we are facing at the moment. The funding people, the funding bodies, they normally need references, a lot of documents, we have some because we are open over a year, you know places like the Broomhall Forum that would suppose to help with projects like ours it has never been there for us, from the Forum. So a lot of people in the area really are asking what is the Forum for and no one is answering questions. Because the Forum is suppose to help. Because the forum is there for the rich area..." [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.01].

A critical resident from the neighbourhood even published a letter in the *Broomhall News* to criticise the negative role of the BF affecting the communities within the neighbourhood:

"Letters. Dear Broomhall News, Can anyone fill us in a bit more on this "Broomhall Forum?" Somebody told me, maybe jokingly, it's a wholly owned subsidiary of the YMCA; someone else said, "No, that's Broomhall Cosmopolitan." More seriously, I think twice now we got a flyer through the door saying "come to our Annual General Meeting," but aside from that... Then , early this summer, and just months into his office term of office, I saw a letter from the Chair resigning his post. Rightly or wrongly, he had some pretty strong things to say about how it fails to relate to the community which certainly struck a chord with me. Members of the Broomhall Park Association have since received rather furtively-phrased Minutes of follow-up meeting, but some of us ordinarily folk, this end of the neighbourhood, haven't even got that. Please, can somebody in-the-know tell us what is going on? And, for that matter, what exactly IS Broomhall Forum? What is set up to do? Who is supposed to represent? And what connection does it claim with the folk who live around here? Thank you. John Revill." (Revill, 2005: 3).

In addition, not only BME (Black Minority Ethnic) organisations have complained about the BF because they do not fund their projects. Even a highly respected and valued organisation from the voluntary sector complains because the Broomhall Forum does not fund them:

"We are desperately trying to get the resources to increase our level of service in Broomhall but we haven't been able to do so. We've talked to the Broomhall Forum to fund us because they have money available sitting on it and they have identified key needs, but it's very difficult to that community being fragmented to make a decision to where spend money. And they have got money sitting out for ages because they are not ready to make a decision to spend." [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.05].

According to another information provider the Broomhall Forum (BF) budget was:

"current budget is… nearly £ 500 000 over the next three and half years [from November 2005 until May 2009]" [an information provider from section D of Broomhall] [I.P.06].

The author of this project also wonders why the BF did not fund those organisations if they have had the money since 1998. According to the evidence generated, it has emerged that the BF only funds small short projects of a few hundred pounds a year, and they spend the rest of the money paying themselves huge amounts of money in salaries.

For instance, an internal document from the BF, a minute from an Annual General Meeting (which was open to the public to attend from within or outside

the community) corroborates this. A member of the Broomhall Forum (BF), at the 2005 AGM presented the accounts for the period 1st April 2004 to 31st March 2005. From £37,474 pounds the BF received, £ 29, 286 pounds were spent in salaries for the BF's staff, only £ 2,252 were spent to fund community activities, and the rest was given to the YMCA because this charity company hosts the BF (Broomhall Forum, 2005: 3). That is, 78.15 % was spent on staff's salary, and only 6.0 % to fund community projects, and funding community projects is allegedly the reason for the existence of the Broomhall Forum (BF).

Therefore, it is not surprising that most Broomhall residents perceive the BF as having a considerably negative impact on the communities of the Broomhall neighbourhood. These are some of these perceptions:

> *"the Broomhall Forum has been for ages, but it hasn't done anything for the community." [a working class resident from section B of Broomhall] [R.I. 10].*

> *"The people in the Broomhall Forum, Families United [user meant Family Service Unit at 86 Upper Hanover St., section C of Broomhall and closed permanently by mid 2006], with no disrespect, they seem no doing much for our people in this estate [Hanover Flats, Exeter Drive, Sheffield, S3]." [a working class resident from section A] [F.G.03.C].*

> *the [Broomhall] Forum is concentrating only on one side of the area which is... Maybe to put it clearly... the richest side of Broomhall where they talk about doing speed bumps, but here there are a lot of things needed to be. But here there are more urgent matters to deal with but the Forum they don't address them." [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.01].*

> *"I think the complexity and the funding regimes of different services and the way they're organized and they way they shift from time to time hasn't helped, from the government. Once they funded Broomhall, then they lumped it with other organizations, and then back to other area, and then back to Broomhall… these funding shifts are just so complex and bureaucratic and much more than what they need to be and they [the government] complicating things it just don't help. So the Broomhall Forum if they got some money why on Earth they just don't use it and do something with it? Things like the Learning Skills of the council [Sheffield City Council] a lot of money is just wasted, not only at a community level." [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.05].*

The next section presents, analyses, and discusses the information needs that emerged from the political issues.

5.2.4.2   INFORMATION NEEDS RELATED TO POLITICAL ISSUES

Political information needs should not be assessed as a collective action of equal benefit for all, because the members of the three major classes analysed in this project have very distinctive differences and each follow very different interests from one another.

> 1) When working class residents need political information they are calling basically to the government for a decent and affordable house to rent, because it is very unlikely they will ever buy one in a lifetime. Supporting or not the capitalist or middle classes will not in any way improve their living conditions. But most working class residents lack sufficient understanding about the issues surrounding their lives, because their educational backgrounds are very low (Cassen and Kingdon, 2007), or because they have cognitive failures caused by for example an inadequate intake of iron

due to endemic poverty (Sagan, 1997), or because of a huge number of other causes.

2) When middle class residents call for political housing action they are basically calling on the parties involved (namely the government) to preserve their homes from the danger of demolition by the government, slum clearance policies, and so on. For those actions they need the full support of the working classes, not because by obtaining their support these will become middle class, or home owners themselves, but because their collective strength serves well their own benefit.

3) When capitalist class members call for housing political action they are basically calling on the parties involved (namely the government and citizens of all classes especially the middle classes who most of the time serve well their interests) to give their business freedom to do business: to use brown, or green field sites or demolish old buildings in order to build, develop, or redevelop properties and obtain economic profits for their business.

The next section presents, analyses, and discusses the ways in which information providers tried to meet the information needs that emerged from political issues.

5.2.4.3   INFORMATION PROVISION RELATED TO POLITICAL ISSUES

If the issues of *territoriality or uses of the land* have emerged in Broomhall as the most pervasive and with the most adverse effects for most of its residents, particularly for poor working classes, almost as a natural consequence it also emerged that the main political issues are correlated with *territoriality or uses of the land.* As the evidence shown above related to the Broomhall Park conservation area, section D of Broomhall (Connell, 1968; Sheffield Corporation, 1974; City of Sheffield, 1989; Sheffield City Council, 2007a: 23), and the Havelock Housing Action, section C (Hall, 1981; Crook, et. al., 1976; Crook, 1983; Gibson and Dorfman, 1981), the political participation of the different individuals or groups is not geared to the collective benefit. Instead, they are motivated primarily by their private interests which they think will be well served by collective action. The political scientist James Q. Wilson (cited in Bennett, 1997: 664) in the early 1960s supported this idea by arguing that most people in the neighbourhoods, who engage in collective action to improve their housing and other conditions, do not necessarily do so by aiming consciously for the betterment of everyone through political action for social change:

> "Because of the private-regarding nature of their attachment to the community, they are likely to collaborate when each person can see a danger to him or to his family in some proposed change; collective action is a way, not of defining some broad program for the benefit of all, but of giving force to individual objections by adding them together in a collective protest." (cited in Bennett, 1997: 664).

However, since all the social classes have historically been struggling amongst themselves, the dominant classes attempting to take advantage over the dominated, as the concept of the *social class struggles* has been defined in the Methodology (Chapter 2), the political action of the people acting inside or outside Broomhall is no exception. On the same lines, a political philosopher (Demirovic, 2004) observes that the dominant classes exert their hegemony

and domination through the monopolization of knowledge and information, which is of the particular interest of this research project. That is, they withhold and conceal information so the dominated classes, namely the working classes do not know what the powerful dominant and hegemonic classes (e.g. capitalist or bourgeois and middle classes) are doing allegedly to their benefit or against them:

> "As far as political domination is concerned, where knowledge [*and information, MUELA-MEZA, Z.M.]* can be monopolized, news reports and information create a considerable source of power; for those who are dominated can never know exactly what others are doing, which modes of collective behavior are developing and succeeding, and with which political reactions and decision they will have to contend" (Demirovic, 2004).

A Nobel laureate physicist concurs with that idea:

> "Moreover, under existing conditions, private capitalists inevitably control, directly or indirectly, the main sources of information (press, radio, education [and libraries and other documental information institutions]). It is thus extremely difficult, and indeed in most cases quite impossible, for the individual citizen to come to objective conclusions and to make intelligent use of his political rights" (Einstein, 1949: 156-157).

How, then, do the powerful dominant classes –capitalist or bourgeois and middle classes— monopolize and conceal knowledge and information from the dominated classes? Demirovic responds to this question in these terms:

> "The state [*and virtually any powerful individual or political organization, or information provider, or Institution of Documental Information*, MUELA-MEZA, Z.M.], however, defines public communication in a further sense. For the state is the sphere of political decision. Not everything that is decided is the result of previous communication. It is much more the case that politics must react to new challenges: the development of oil prices, an environmental catastrophe, currency speculation, or decisions made by international committees. In all of these cases parliament is called upon to agree to decisions made by the government. The public arena can then criticize political action after the fact. But this has no consequences. The state has won time and created facts. The possibility, bound up with the concept of the public arena - namely, to make virtually everything the object of public discussion - once again suffers irreparably from an unavoidable non-simultaneity: public discussion always comes too late" (Demirovic, 2004)

And that is what has happened, happens and will happen in Broomhall as long as the state of things continues in the way they have been found in this project.

5.2.5 Issues, information needs, and provision related to culture

The sections below present, analyse, and discuss the issues, information needs, and provision about culture.

5.2.5.1 CULTURAL ISSUES

When any issue of the Broomhall community is discussed in the light of many of the parties involved in the promotion or hampering of the development of the community, intercultural issues come into the picture. Also as some residents mentioned in this report, there is a perceptible lack of communication amongst the diverse parties involved in the Broomhall community.

As has been mentioned earlier, Broomhall is one of the wealthiest multi-cultural communities in Sheffield. Thus as might be expected in multi-cultural

environments, many problems arise from this diversity, on linguistic, religious, ethnic, national, educational, or other grounds.

As far as this research goes, a real sense of unity amongst many respondents could not be found, because most of them did not like students and saw them as invaders or intruders in "their" community, not considering that they are also part of the community. The working class people are the majority of the community and they belong to the community but so do the middle and capitalist class people. These perceptions support this idea:

"Many of the ladies from Somalia they dress their clothes and local British see them threatening. And I think the local newspapers treat minorities bad." [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.A].

"We all come from similar roots and we come from the countries of these minorities and also we are British, so we can bring both worlds to these people. So I also think that the media is playing a bad image to portraying bad the ethnic minorities, but our Middle Eastern and Arabian people have input much about our cultures in Europe and all over the world." [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.A].

"But no one help minorities and give them a piece of land to use it say as a youth centre. And you know all minorities are isolated. And the British don't mix with the ethnic minorities, these are different cultures, it is a clash of cultures, British and minorities are very different for socializing." [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.A].

"it doesn't matter how people see each other as long as they see them as human beings and with tolerance to differences. So the big danger I see is when they see each other too much under religion. And the government is passing laws to ban discrimination on the grounds of religious beliefs. So people should respect everybody's religions and also the secular people who don't have a religious belief, and see each other as human beings. I really see this fragmentations caused by faith communities as counterproductive." [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.05].

However bad these issues may look, there are also some positive impressions from individuals and their families who came as asylum seekers and refugees into the UK from African and middle-eastern countries:

"Even if they live here in a very democratic culture many children are answering back their parents and they are losing some good cultural things from back home. But at the same time they are gaining some good cultural things. Like one of the diseases from Middle East is tribalism. You are from that tribe, no I can't do anything, I can't marry you because you are not from my tribe, your tribe is not good. Very pathetic you know, same country, same language but with tribe problems, you know. And this is something I like about England, because here you don't go for the tribe, it is about your brain, how much can you apply for your mind. How much can you get from life through your mind. So that's something I like too." [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.A].

Other respondents elaborate on the positive sides of living in the UK:

"You know what she wants to say is that... You know that is what I like about England is that no one asks you about tribes and that is something very good even among Somali here. You know in our country no one can marry any one from other tribes because they put first the tribes and they don't marry people from other tribes even if you are beautiful or rich. So I think here that the young generations we are happy here, but in our country is very bad because of the tribalism." [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.B].

"I think the Broomhall community is much more fragmented than others because of historic reasons and much has to do on faith fragmentation." [an information provider from section C of Broomhall] [I.P.05].

5.2.5.2   INFORMATION NEEDS RELATED TO CULTURAL ISSUES

This section presents, analyses, and discusses the information needs that emerged from the cultural issues.

From the evidence presented above it was found that the social class struggle concept cannot be applied properly to cultural information needs. Cultural information needs are felt from individuals irrespective of their social class. What individuals need is information that helps them to understand and value different cultures; to be more tolerant and respectful of different cultures.

The next section presents, analyses, and discusses the ways in which information providers tried to meet the information needs that emerged from cultural issues.

5.2.5.3   INFORMATION PROVISION RELATED TO CULTURAL ISSUES

It has emerged, through observation and the author's own participation as a library user, that the Sheffield Central Library information services are very good information providers. For more than 3 years in different periods the author has rung (or visited) the library and asked them for different queries just to see how the library would provide him with information. And during all this time they have responded with precision, pertinence, and above all, with a nice mood and patience. They have looked up information in local directories, in electronic databases and they have always given him positive answers. In most of the cases as expected they have referred him to other agencies giving him names of agencies, and telephone contacts. The treatment has always been nice, kind, obliging and respectful regardless of the type of query.

But in the case of cultural provision of information the traditional documental information institutions (DIIs) such as libraries or the Citizens' Advice Bureau (CAB) do not cover all the widest range of information needs. In such a case there are intercultural gateways within the neighbourhood.

> "I don't know to what extent [name of person omitted] is a gateway too, but the fact that is a Somali shop and have a large, so you see many male Somalis coming and going, socializing, not just shopping, so you have this difference of socializing and shopping like in Coronation Street. if you watch it... people know there is a blend of shopping and socializing which doesn't exist in the giant supermarket, so I'm guessing that is another gateway, so I'm thinking of gateways of [name of person omitted], City Wide Learning, and [name of person omitted], and of course religious gateways which I wouldn't know about... there are religious groups which meet at Broomspring Centre [Broomhall Centre] and in Sunny Bank Centre or seemingly religious groups." [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 01].

The author tried very hard to approach some of these gateways, but had no success. Hence it could not be assessed to what extent these gateways satisfy people's information, advice, or help needs. More research is needed in that regard.

However as in the case of other disciplines, e.g. medicine, the provision of medical services through scientifically mediated GPs, hospitals and so on is not the same as that of shaman witch doctors (with due respect to shamans). Likewise, scientifically mediated information, advice and help provision through Documental Information Institutions (DIIs), e.g. libraries, CABs, are not the

same as those provided by intercultural gateways which cannot be made accountable for the services they provide. Basically no one knows about their facilities, conditions, quality, extent, etc.

They might be able to serve effectively people of their own ethnic background, nationality, and so on. But that is only a supposition which is not backed by evidence. The facts instead are that these intercultural gateways providers are more prone to provide inadequate services, because they are based on a myriad of non publicly accountable ways: tribalism, kinship, religious brotherhoods, privatisation, pay-per-service, etc. Such non publicly accountable or 'underground' information providers have been found as negative activities which undermine citizenship rights (Marquand, 2004).

5.2.6 Issues, information needs, and provision related to communication

The sections below present, analyse, and discuss the issues, information needs, and provision about communication.

5.2.6.1 COMMUNICATION ISSUES

During many visits paid by the researcher to all four sections of Broomhall for more than 3 years, it was found by observation that the busiest telephone boxes were those located in the middle of section A, the Hanover Flats. And all the times there were queues of people waiting to call. They were used especially by teenagers making long calls and young adults short calls. All the other telephone boxes in sections B or C were rarely used.

Although there was a short distance from the telephone box inside Hanover Flats to the one located at the end of Hanover Street at the junction of Hanover Way where the Hanover Playground ends northbound, people preferred to wait patiently to call in the one located within section A. Whereas in section D, the Park, no telephone box could be found for the public to use, there were some inside the Sheffield Hallam University halls mainly for people related to the university.

However, the most critical issue was the language barrier for individuals whose mother tongues were other than English as some respondents noted:

> *"Many people don't speak English, there is a high population of Somali people in this estate and they don't speak English." [a working class resident from section A] [F.G.03.B].*

> *"communication is a big issue here because many kids' parents don't speak English and we cannot afford having translators for all, so we basically send information in English, so we end up having a lot of parents' meeting because of language issues. Communication is a big issue here definitively. So we need bilingual support employed by the school. We pay them but with the help of the city council [Sheffield City Council] we have grants from the ethnic minorities' grants. Because we have 89% percent of children coming from ethnic minorities so we need strong support from the council [Sheffield City Council] to attain it." [an information provider from section B of Broomhall] [I.P.07].*

> *"we value the original languages spoken at home, we value and encourage parents on that, you can see at the entrance of the school [Broomspring Primary School] we have greetings written in many languages. But we also value our children learning English and that's why we teach them only in English so they can be able to integrate in the British society and be able get a job and so on, besides that's also what their parents want. Parents are very*

mucho so into education and that's the easy part of the job because parents back you up and support you which you don't get much in all schools, but in this school it's very much so." [an information provider from section B of Broomhall] [I.P.07].

"We also teach English for parents, we manage to contract the teachers and we teach them here for free. At the moment we teach them once a week." [an information provider from section B of Broomhall] [I.P.07]

"The main thing is about, what could happen to the whole community, when they focus, when they would come together, to have a magnet to have shared, common interest, be this information, communication. Probably we have a communication problem." [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 08].

Some respondents mentioned that the English language communication barrier presented a big problem for the integration of the non English speakers to British culture:

"You know the big problem with the British integration is that the British way where all the people coming here is that everyone should be integrated in the way British way is. But in UK there are big problems where they are losing respect to elderly, the British children robe the elderly and that is a bad thing and people from our communities should not be integrated in this culture. And also the war of the UK with our taxes, so we don't want to be integrated in this culture. And see, the British media don't shows the truth and expose our minorities as bad, but in reality they are not bad. And also they portray the migrants and asylum seekers as if they come here to take all the wealth from UK, but the media lies, because no one will leave their countries just for the fun, that is a huge mistake by the media." [an upper working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.C].

5.2.6.2 INFORMATION NEEDS RELATED TO COMMUNICATION ISSUES

The next section presents, analyses, and discusses the information needs that emerged from the communication issues. To summarise the evidence presented above and the author's interpretation, these include the following.

- Working class residents need information to know, for instance, how their relatives could learn English
- Middle and capitalist classes need information to know, for instance, how to make business out of the communication needs of the working classes.

The next section presents, analyses, and discusses the ways in which information providers tried to meet the information needs that emerged from communication issues.

5.2.6.3 INFORMATION PROVISION RELATED TO COMMUNICATION ISSUES

The major communication issue is that many people do not speak English in Broomhall. That becomes a barrier to them becoming citizens. Hence, they become excluded from the major benefits of being integrated in British society.

The *Broomhall News* is perhaps the most important medium of communication amongst the Broomhall residents. However, it is a newspaper written only in English. It is a voluntary community newspaper distributed for all residents of sections A, B, and C (but not D) in Broomhall that started in 2002. On 29 May 2002 it received its first grant of £ 2400 from Awards for All England (Awards for All England, 2002); in 2003 received a grant from the South Yorkshire Community Foundation (2004).

"Broomhall News, everybody is waiting to come, because Broomhall News is very good at telling people what's going on in Broomhall..." [a middle class resident from section C] [R.I. 04].

"The Broomhall News acts as a forum if you like for the community where they can voice their opinions. We always encourage members of the community to come forward and we also certainly provide information that is useful to everyone basically, we have lists of service which will advertise or signpost for instance health issues and so on. It's basically, provides an opportunity for the community to get its voice heard and it connects people together." [an information provider from section A of Broomhall] [I.P.02].

5.2.7 Features, information needs, and provision related to transport

The sections below present, analyse, and discuss the features, information needs, and provision about transport.

5.2.7.1   TRANSPORT FEATURES

Broomhall is flanked by many public transport services: the tram on Glossop Road and West Street just off the limits of sections B and C; buses on Glossop Road and West street off the limits of sections B and C; buses on Ecclesall Road off the boundaries of sections A, C and D; an inner neighbourhood bus, the First M29 (First, 2003), which runs in some streets within sections C and D where most of the senior residents live; and there is the Sheffield City Council community transport provided to people with mobility disabilities upon request.

But there is not a general consensus to consider transport as a positive feature for all the residents of Broomhall. A working class respondent argues that transport, in particular the M29 is not a good service:

"Transport? I can only say there is only one bus M29, it's not really a good service, established service, there's no bus stops, it stops anywhere you want it to stop, and it doesn't follow the signals." [a working class respondent from section C] [F.G.01.A].

But another working class respondent argues the contrary and considers that the only problem with transport is parking:

"And yes, we got good transport, we got buses, tram, we are 10 minutes away from the city centre, so not so many problems with transport, but we have lots of problems of parking, always and forever." [a working class resident from section B] [F.G.02.A].

Furthermore, Sheffield and particularly Broomhall is becoming increasingly gentrified, hence transport needs are likely to become critical and severe for older people from working class backgrounds. Having access or not to the M29 internal line within some Broomhall streets is a factor which makes the difference between provision or deprivation of transport services, especially around the places where most elderly live.

There is a consensus that many users and non users of the M29 bus service value very much the service (Broomhall News, 2004b). However, the impressions of residents of transport may depend mainly on their age, that is on the ability of individuals to be able to walk by themselves --a condition which is interrelated with individuals' social class (e.g. being old but owing a car),

physical, and health conditions (e.g. having disabilities preventing walking or driving a car), amongst others.

For instance, from the literature a mobility-disabled resident complained that the M29 service has been reduced. He gave up his car and does not have a driveway to park one, thus affecting his mobility conditions and basically his life:

> "No car, no go ... I am a disabled pensioner who 16 months ago moved into a bungalow in Broomhall. Having no driveway and eligible to a free bus-pass I gave up my car. Now the bus service around this estate has been cut to just twice a day with no Saturday or Sunday. This is annoying, considering the Government wants us to give up our cars in favour of public transport (along with the reduction of Co2)" (Star (Sheffield), 2007c).

Despite these not so positive aspects of transport, the public provision of this service prevails as an overall positive feature of Broomhall.

Nevertheless, the author has found that in 1905 Sheffield was better provided than today with 281 miles of tramways (Olive, 2002). Electrical tram lines were more ecological, but since the 1940s Nazi blitz only four lines are running. Hence with more combustion engine powered buses there is more contamination. However, some residents might not be aware of historic facts like this and are opposed to any tram extension proposal (SYPTA, 2004):

> "… no, we will never allow the plans for the tram extension in Broomhill [2]…" [an information provider from Broomhill] [I.P.03].

The next section presents, analyses, and discusses the information needs that emerged relating to transport.

5.2.7.2 INFORMATION NEEDS RELATED TO TRANSPORT

What are the community information needs related to transport? To summarise the evidence presented above and the author's interpretation, these include the following.

- Working class residents need information about the M29, or other bus or tram routes timetables.
- Middle class residents need information on petrol prices; car prices, and so on.
- Capitalist classes need information on how buy and sell cars, buses, petrol stations, and so on.

---

[2] Broomhill is a middle upper class neighbourhood adjacent to Broomhall to the north through Glossop Road, where the Broomhill tram line was planned in 2004 (SYPTA, 2004). Within Broomhill boundaries is located the Hallamshire Hospital, in Glossop Road, opposite to Broomhall, and other two hospitals are located within Broomhill behind Hallamshire. These hospitals and the hub of health services nearby attract many people: patients, health professionals, health providers, etc., hence, by observation could be made evident that there are many people coming and going in this area and that there is a serious parking problem within the area and surrounding areas (like Broomhall). Hence, in this project could not be found the reasons why the plans for a Broomhill tram extension did not come to fruition, but a tram extension in that area would alleviate much the traffic problems. However, those are issues related to Broomhill, not Broomhall.

The next section presents, analyses, and discusses the ways in which information providers tried to meet the information needs that emerged relating to transport.

5.2.7.3   INFORMATION PROVISION RELATED TO TRANSPORT

The major information provider on transport is the statutory sector with two main offices in the city centre, Sheffield Interchange and a small branch in Arundel Street.

The next section explains the features, information needs, and provision related to education.

5.2.8 Features, information needs, and provision related to education

The sections below present, analyse, and discuss the features, information needs, and provision relating to education.

5.2.8.1   EDUCATIONAL FEATURES

This section analyses the major educational features found.

5.2.8.1.1 The Springfield Primary School

One of the best educational institutions in Broomhall as perceived by some members of the community through the data generated in this project is Springfield Primary School. This is how a respondent from this school praises its importance:

> *"I think Springfield [Primary School] is the best facility without sounding with lack of modesty. But we are the most accessible facility for the community and because they trust us they come to us with lots of issues, as bills, phone bills, and community issues, whereas in other communities they've got advice bureaus, the local church, whereas here, families tend to come here to get support. And this is quite challenging for a school because our main goal is children education, but we do a lot of family support. Our core purpose is teaching, we're here to make sure our children learn, but we end up having to support families in a lot of different ways, because if we don't do it nobody will do it". [an information provider from section B of Broomhall] [I.P.07].*

The impression from this respondent [I.P. 07] may appear as inclined only towards the positive side. Indeed, this impression has also been shared by the inspectors of the Sheffield Local Education Authority:

> "Inspectors have rated a Sheffield primary school as 'good' - despite it coming in the bottom five per cent in recent national league tables. Springfield Primary in Broomhall was found to provide well for its pupils, who come from a wide range of minority ethnic groups and speak 15 different languages. It takes in children of refugees and asylum seekers, as well as children of students who have travelled to Sheffield from overseas. Many often speak little English, with over 85 per cent of the children speaking it as a second language. Many more pupils than normal at Springfield have learning difficulties, while the school also has a high turnover of youngsters. But inspectors found a very high quality of pastoral care and support which meant the children's diverse personal needs were successfully met, while there were good partnerships with parents and external agencies. Pupils felt happy, safe and secure which helped them to achieve well, and teachers were very successful in helping the children learn to speak English. The youngest children made good progress, and this trend was continued throughout the school" (Star (Sheffield), 2005c).

The aforementioned data suggests that the Springfield Primary School is one of the most positive features in the neighbourhood, and this is also confirmed by observation and by the opinions of other respondents.

5.2.8.1.2 The City Wide Learning centre

Another relevant educational institution was the City Wide Learning centre, the motto of which was "The Key to your Enlightenment." This was an educational centre inaugurated at 1.00 pm Monday afternoon on the 19th April 2004 (Broomhall News, 2004a: 3). This centre was founded and managed by a Somali group. It was "open to all, but mainly to [the] Black Ethnic Minority" (Broomhall News, 2004a: 3).

The centre was opened on some abandoned premises where there used to be betting shops according to one respondent. This substitution of betting shops for an educational centre seemed to be a positive move for the benefit of all people. But not everyone seemed to be happy with this move. There seemed to be discontent for the lack of betting shops within Broomhall amongst some residents, and an anonymous resident even call this lack of betting shops a "disgrace" through the *Broomhall News* community newspaper:

> "… most people would agree that not having a betting shop in Broomhall is a local disgrace. We've all heard pensioners complain about having to go all the way to West Street to put a bet on. There is a plucky 78 year old, crippled with arthritis, who has to set off from his Exeter Drive flat at 6 in the morning to get to the bookies with his Lotto and Lucky 7 bets" (MOD 'The Voice in the Street', 2002: 3).

This anonymous resident complaining of the lack of betting shops within Broomhall, that is, closer to the Exeter Drive flats of section A, did not specifically complain of the taking over of the betting premises by the City Wide Learning centre, because this centre was open on April 2004, and his letter was published on July 2002. But his or her opinion is presented here as a contrasting view in order to illustrate the contradictory character of the different people assessed in this project.

In this project it was not possible to trace the reasons why the betting shops were closed on the premises then taken over by the City Wide Learning centre. And it was not possible to verify if the three premises from 247 to 249 were all betting shops. For instance, in an informal chat someone told the researcher that there used to be a laundry shop in one of the three premises, but this could not be verified either.

The City Wide Learning centre was found as a positive institution, specially for larger parts of the Black and Minority Ethnic residents, and as a positive information provider from most of the residents, despite the fact that the customers of gambling shops did not appreciate it in that way.

However, it was found that the police closed the centre on the basis of alleged frauds relating to the UK's Home Office citizenship tests according to information provided by whistleblowers (Star (Sheffield), 2007b). Without warning the police seized early in February 2007 all the computers from the school and questioned four top management members of the centre at one of

the police headquarters; but they were released on bail and no one was later charged. The police, a month later, returned the computers, and the school reopened without major complications.

The author, in early April 2007 (and in late stages of thesis writing), approached one of the school's staff and asked him, informally, about the closure of the centre by the police and all about the situation. That person told the researcher that it was a mistake by the police and that everything was okay back then. He also told him that the LearnDirect educational institution cancelled for good the contract with the school due to the unstable legal situation of the centre after the police closure, but he also told him that the Sheffield College branch continued the contract, and hence the centre continued offering free English courses and other course for BMEs (Black Minority Ethnic) and the general public.

In May 2007 the school remained open, but in a room at 248 Broomhall Street a new enterprise opened -- a kind of reading room for BME (Black Minority Ethnic) children; particularly Somali. The author approached this teacher, but he could not give the author any details about that reading room except that he mentioned that it was independent from the City Wide Learning centre. The researcher could not read what the children read because the books were written in Somali, Arabic, Urdu, or Farsi types of languages.

By June 2007 the children's reading room closed, and a Somali telephone call and money transfer shop opened in the same room; the Dahabshill Diamond Call Centre and Money Transfer. But in the third week of August 2007 the City Wide Learning centre closed its doors to the public for good, according to the author's observation and by the information provided by a Somali manager of the Dahabshill telephone call centre shop and other Somali neighbours from around that shop.

5.2.8.1.3 The Broomhall Nursery

Another outstanding educational institution within Broomhall territories is the Broomhall Nursery. This nursery is located on Broomhall Road in section D but serves all four sections of Broomhall and city-wide residents' children.

5.2.8.1.4 The Broomhall Centre

> The Broomhall Centre, according to the documents collected, is a kind of drop-in centre for all the residents of the community. It offers many free activities and classes to the community like football classes (Broomhall Centre, 2003a); Brazilian Samba classes by the Sheffield Samba Band (Broomhall Centre, 2003b). It rents the premises for parties and all kinds of social gatherings, amongst many others.

5.2.8.2   INFORMATION NEEDS RELATED TO EDUCATIONAL FEATURES

This section presents, analyses, and discusses the information needs that emerged from the educational features. To summarise the evidence presented above and the author's interpretation, these include the following:

- Working class residents need educational information about how to enrol their children in statutory LEA schools.
- Middle class residents need educational information about how to register their children in schools, colleges, universities.
- Capitalist class residents need educational information to find out about the expansionist plans of universities and see how they could be contracted to build more academic halls, and so on.

The next section presents, analyses, and discusses the ways in which information providers tried to meet the information needs that emerged from the education features.

5.2.8.3   INFORMATION PROVISION RELATED TO EDUCATIONAL FEATURES

Depending on the level of education each school, college, university is responsible for its own provision. Nevertheless, the Local Education Authority (LEA) is the main information provider located in the Moor, city centre and some other branches elsewhere.

And from the LEA the most important information provider was the Broomhall Nursery. Besides good nursery services, the Broomhall Nursery also offered a whole range of impressive information, advice, help, and similar services provided for children under 5 years old and their parents. These are some of the perceptions of parents:

> *"the government has a very good library services for children at the age of 4 called Sharrow Sure Start based in Broomhall Nursery in Broomhall Street, they offer books and reading activities for children, for free." [a working class resident from section A] [R.I. 09].*

> *"they are having doing very nice activities for parents and children from birth to four in Broomhall Nursery from Sharrow Sure Start, now they are bringing little by little something good for the community... Sharrow Sure Start is building a new building in Sharrow Road... Oh gosh yes, it's a fantastic service [Sharrow Sure Start] they've brought for the community." [a working class resident from section A] [R.I. 09].*

This was verified by the press:

> "The centres [included the Broomhall Nursery] will provide a range of services, including education and childcare for under fives, support for families and single parents, healthcare and links with schools, information services and job centres" (Star (Sheffield), 2006c).

It was also verified by observation. One of the teachers from the Broomhall Nursery was seen several times in the Hanover Flats (section A) giving support to mothers of the children attending the Broomhall Nursery.

Nevertheless, despite all of its positive features, the Broomhall Nursery did not escape from having apparently faced some controversial issues. For instance, in 2004, according to the press, its management sacked some teachers:

> "The most common reason for the cuts are falling pupil numbers. The Sheffield pupil population is falling year by year, a situation which has already led to the closure or merger of some primaries" (Star (Sheffield), 2004g).

Presumably for the same reason the Broomhall Nursery closed its branch located in Mushroom Lane behind the Department of Psychology of the

University of Sheffield and the Weston Park Museum by the end of 2004. But parents complained that apparently the nursery management did not consult about closure with the Local Education Authority since it was given extraordinary and independent powers to exercise policies and budget without consulting the LEA:

> "Parents believe the closure plans have been drawn up by Broomhall [Nursery] without the knowledge of the local education authority. Since April [2004], Broomhall nursery has been given new powers to independently run its own financial affairs. As long as places are not removed altogether, governors and staff will feel they have the authority to close the annexe" (Star (Sheffield), 2004e).

Nevertheless, the Broomhall Nursery emerged as a very positive institution in Broomhall, and, although they closed the Mushroom Lane branch, that does not affect the positive evaluation being made through respondents and observation.

However, the closure of that branch did show by inference, that the areas within and around Broomhall, due to the expansion of Sheffield and Hallam universities and the fast paced urban development of high rise and up market multiple occupation housing for single students and couples without children, are losing their family character, and thus services such as the Mushroom Lane branch of the Broomhall Nursery are being closed due to the lack of children.

5.3   Summary

This chapter is the core of the thesis. It presented the main analysis, and discussions of the major findings.

The analysis and discussions flowed through the three major conceptual and methodological parts of the thesis:

a) The issues and features of the Broomhall neighbourhood that emerged from the residents' and information providers' perceptions, from observation, and from the literature.
b) The information needs that emerged from these issues and features.
c) The information provision that tried to meet these information needs.

As for part a), this thesis from the onset did not plan to create a *community profile of Broomhall.* However, the issues and features of this neighbourhood can be considered for the LIS community as a community profile. This thesis did not consider creating an actual community profile of Broomhall, because these instruments are part of the planning processes of established libraries or other Documental Information Institutions (DIIs). For this thesis, the *community profiling* tool was simply used for academic purposes, not to plan or measure findings against any aims or objectives of any particular library, institution, or organisation.

As for part b), the residents of Broomhall seldom articulated their needs of information as *information needs.* The residents perceived daily life problems, issues, concerns, fears, and the like. The residents needed information, but they did not mean the concept of *information as recorded in documents.* It was the major contribution of this thesis to have served as a bridge between the issues and features perceived by residents according to the way they enjoy, or

suffer under their material living conditions, and the information recorded in documents that, hopefully, would make those living conditions more enjoyable, and help them to cope better with suffering. For this, the interpretivist methodology played a key role for the researcher to help him translate residents' daily life problems, issues, concerns, fears, and the like into *information needs.*

As for part c), the voluntary sector played the main role in satisfying residents' information needs on a permanent basis acting as a Documental Information Institution, particularly the Sharrow Citizens Advice Bureau, both through their main office located in the Sharrow neighbourhood, and through the extension services they offer at the Hanover Medical Centre in Broomhall (section C). The statutory sector also played a major role in satisfying the residents' information needs, but this role was secondary when compared with the Sharrow Citizens Advice Bureau. From the local authority, the Sheffield City Council emerged as the main information provider from the statutory sector: for example the First Point service at Howden House for housing information needs (the main issue of Broomhall in this thesis); and the Library, Archives, and Information Services by linking diverse needs to other different agencies (particularly the Mobile Library that reaches Broomhall directly). From Central Government the main information provider was the Sharrow Sure Start program which provided library and information services, help, advice and other services to parents and their children up to five years old. This provision was conducted in coordination with the Sheffield City Council's Local Education Authority (in this case provided through the Broomhall Nursery located in section D), and the Library, Archives, and Information Services (through the Highfield Library located in the Sharrow neighbourhood). However, despite the excellence of this service, it was available only to parents who have children up to five years, and excluded the rest of the citizens. As for the documents delivered through letterboxes in Broomhall, those from Sheffield City Council were the most relevant to meet residents' information needs, although they were the most scarce compared to commercial flyers. Finally, the Broomhall Community Centre served as the main grey literature provider. However, only two documents were relevant to the most critical information needs throughout the thesis: those relating to issues of territoriality or uses of the land.

In general terms, the information needs of the residents of the Broomhall have not been well researched by previous researchers. Those who have conducted research into Broomhall have not considered information needs specifically, and, in general, their research projects have more been motivated by political, commercial, or ideological concerns. Hence, they have not addressed information needs motivated by the highest ethical standards of pursuing knowledge for the sake of knowledge, or to empower the people to honestly improve their living conditions, as has been the motivation of this project. Therefore, the lack of a critical and analytical research study to survey at deeper levels the problems and issues people face in their daily life, such as this project was intended to be, has prevented residents from coping with their most pressing information needs. At the same time, it has prevented information providers from really meeting their most relevant needs.

Having analysed and discussed the major findings of this project, the next chapter (Chapter 6) discusses the further research steps the researcher will

take in order to make these finding available to the widest public, and the insights that emerged from this thesis and consequent suggestions for the LIS and social sciences communities.