

**A working class critique to the bourgeois policies of dismantling the full tenure and perpetuating renewable contracts affecting library workers ¹
por: Zapopan Martín Muela-Meza (MEXICO) ²**

Abstract

This paper, “**A working class critique to the bourgeois policies of dismantling the full tenure and perpetuating renewable contracts affecting library workers**” analyses this research problem: What are some of the most adverse effects of the bourgeois policies of their labor flexibility and precariousness by dismantling the lack of labor tenure and promotion, and by perpetuating the renewal of contracts affecting social and labor stability and thus their humane living conditions, health, and happiness of the workers of library teaching, research, and practice? These are its objectives: a) To analyze the advent of labor flexibility and precariousness policies in the neo-liberal economy; b) To analyze the correlation of the adverse effects of labor flexibility and precariousness with the lack of tenure and promotion, and the constant renewal of contracts in librarianship faculty and practitioners; c) To analyze other possible interrelated factors others than flexibility and precariousness that may also have adverse effects on librarianship academy and practice; d) To assess the possible implications this paper may have on public policies for the benefit of librarianship workers both faculty and librarians. Its conclusions based on the sources analyzed is that capitalist classes are eroding the full time tenure contracting and perpetuating the contingent adjunct faculty contracts affecting librarianship faculty and library workers based on the critical epistemology and critical theories and concepts, mainly comparing the U.S., British, Spanish, and Mexican librarianship. Based on some international critics of capitalism and neo-liberal policies (Bouzas and de la Garza, 1998; Berry, 2002; 2005; Boutang, 2004; Giroux, 2012), and underpinned with critical epistemology and critical librarianship concepts (Muela-Meza, 2004; 2007; 2008; 2010^a; 2010^b; Pawley, 1998; 2003; 2005; 2006; 2009), to analyze these issues as how they affect the workers of librarianship as academics and librarians (as in other non-library milieus e.g. Horner, 2000).

Keywords

Critical librarianship; critical pedagogy; tenure; collective contracting (bargaining); flexibility labor; precarious labor; neoliberalism.

Una crítica de la clase trabajadora a las políticas burguesas por el desmantelamiento de los contratos laborales permanentes y el

¹ Full version of a presentation given at the Part-Time and Adjuncts SIG Session of ALISE 2014, Casualties and Collateral Damages: A Critical Look at Educational Entrepreneurship, Philadelphia, PA, Jan 21-24, 2014.

² Zapopan Muela has a PhD in Information Studies at the University of Sheffield, UK. Currently is a tenured assistant professor and head of the library at the School of Sports Organization, UANL (Mexico). Contact: zapopanmuela@gmail.com.

perpetuamiento de los contratos renovables afectando a los trabajadores bibliotecarios

Resumen

Este ensayo, “Una crítica de la clase trabajadora a las políticas burguesas por el desmantelamiento de los contratos laborales permanentes y el perpetuamiento de los contratos renovables afectando a los trabajadores bibliotecarios,” analiza este problema de investigación: ¿Cuáles son algunos de los efectos más negativos de las políticas burguesas de la flexibilización y precariedad laboral por el desmantelamiento de los contratos de base permanentes y promoción laborales y por el perpetuamiento de los contratos renovables afectando la estabilidad laboral y social y por lo tanto las condiciones humanas de vida, la salud y la felicidad de los trabajadores de la enseñanza, investigación y práctica bibliotecarias? Estos son los objetivos: a) analizar el advenimiento de las políticas económicas neo-liberales de la flexibilización y precariedad; b) analizar la correlación de los efectos adversos de la flexibilización y precariedad con la falta de obtención de contratos permanentes y promoción; c) analizar otros posibles factores interrelacionados con la flexibilidad y la precariedad que puedan tener efectos adversos en la academia y práctica de la bibliotecología; d) valorar las posibles implicaciones de este trabajo sobre las políticas públicas en beneficio de los trabajadores profesores y bibliotecarios de la bibliotecología. Sus conclusiones basadas en las fuentes analizadas es que las clases capitalistas están desmantelando la contratación permanente de base y perpetuando los contratos renovables de profesores y bibliotecarios adjuntos afectando a los trabajadores profesores y bibliotecarios de la bibliotecología, basadas en la epistemología crítica y teorías y conceptos críticos, principalmente comparando la bibliotecología estadounidense, británica, española y mexicana. Basadas en algunos críticos del capitalismo y de las políticas neoliberales (Bouzas and de la Garza, 1998; Berry, 2002; 2005; Giroux, 2012), y fundamentadas en conceptos de la epistemología y bibliotecología crítica (Muela-Meza, 2004; 2007; 2008; 2010^a; 2010^b), para analizar como estos asuntos críticos afectan a los trabajadores profesores y bibliotecarios de la bibliotecología (como en otros escenarios no bibliotecarios, e.g. Horner, 2000).

Palabras clave

Bibliotecología crítica; pedagogía crítica; contratos permanentes; contratos colectivos de trabajo; flexibilización laboral; precariedad laboral; neoliberalismo.

Introduction

The research problem:

What are some of the most adverse effects of labor flexibility and precariousness the lack of tenure and promotion, and the constant renewal of contracts in librarianship faculty and practitioners?

Aim: To analyse to what extent some of the most adverse effects of labor flexibility and precariousness affect the lack of tenure and promotion, and the constant renewal of contracts in librarianship faculty and practitioners.

Objectives

- To analyze the advent of labor flexibility and precariousness in the neo-liberal economy.
- To analyze the correlation of the adverse effects of labor flexibility and precariousness with the lack of tenure and promotion, and the constant renewal of contracts in librarianship faculty and practitioners.
- To analyze other possible interrelated factors others than flexibility and precariousness that may also have adverse effects on librarianship academy and practice.
- To assess the possible implications this study may have on public policies for the benefit of librarianship faculty and librarians.

Working social class struggles conception

In this paper there is an agreement with Marx and Engels in their *Manifesto of the Communist Party* (Marx & Engels, 1976a) that since the advent of capitalism those feudal professions such as Physicians, and Lawyers lost their sacred halo and all of them became proletarian professions, of a cognitive or intellectual kind, but still proletarian though. However, there must be made a class distinction where professions and professionals play in favor of bourgeois or capitalist classes or working classes.

Thus, many scholars worldwide from outside librarianship (e.g. Masuda, 1981; Fukuyama, 1989; Huntington, 1993; Castells, 1996; Ferrer, 1995), or from inside librarianship (e.g. Lau Noriega, 2007^a; 2007b; 2007c; Coloquio ALCI, 2007; Gorman, 2001; Cronin, 1992; Rodríguez Gallardo, 2001; Hernández Pacheco, 2007; 2000; Uribe Tirado, 2005; Guerrero Valle, 2000; Mann, 1993), not only avoid talking about social class struggles when analyzing social phenomena, but they overtly have taken a full blown partisan position in favor of the dominant bourgeois capitalist classes within and outside librarianship.

Thus, social class struggles do exist and we have to assure we employ them in all discourse (Muela-Meza; 2010a; 2010b; Corrigan & Gillespie, 1978; Robledo, 1975a; 1975b). ³ And as of today, society is still mainly divided into capitalist or bourgeois class, middle class, and working class. Therefore, this paper adopts a point of view from the perspective of the working class, or in defense of the working class people. From this perspective there is a critical view that the capitalist or bourgeois class and seconded by the middle class (both considered as the dominant classes), they only care for the interests of the members of their class. They do not care about the working class (or the subdued classes).

Critical epistemology for a critical librarianship as a theoretical framework

³And not only as a político-ideological discourse, but also as part of the human material evolution since earlier human times (e.g. as studied for more than 3 decades by an evolutionist neuroscientist (Hauser, 2006).

The theoretical framework this paper is based on is the sociological labor concept of the **critical epistemology** based on the wide international leftist labor and anti-capitalist movements (e.g. Muela-Meza, 2010a; 2008^a; 2008b; 1996; 1991; de la Garza Toledo, 2001). This consists on submitting ideological discourses to the social critique to dismantle the ideological and political manipulations of the dominant bourgeois classes against working subdued, exploited and oppressed classes (the working, proletarian and labor classes), so that the latter achieve cognitively understand and be aware of the constant bourgeois capitalist manipulations through a process of analysis, critique, resistance and eventually political engagement to counter attack such manipulations and their manipulators. This is so because people no matter what they say they always have an implicit ideology within their discourse (Lenin, 1905 [1974]).

Working class struggles for Full Time Tenure Track (FTTT) versus contingent

At the core of academic class struggles for workers within or outside librarianship is the fight to obtain a Full Time Tenure Track permanent base contracts to assure permanent labor and social security within the job and all the benefits that come with that as a working class scholar criticizes:

“Class Analysis: The first thing to say about the conditions of contingent faculty in general is that they have changed radically since the sector began to grow in the 1970s. For analytical purposes, it is defensible to posit that, in fact, these conditions have changed radically enough to meet the dialectical requirements of quantity changing to quality. This means that the progressive deterioration of conditions, pay, security, and independence of action, as compared to full-time tenure track classically “regular” faculty, have proceeded so far and become so standard as the numbers of these contingent faculty have increased in higher education, that the quantity of changes can be posited as having transformed into the qualitative change of a new class line being drawn within higher education institutions. This class line is not meant to be drawn between contingent and regular faculty, though some have attempted to do so, but rather, as contingent faculty have become the majority, this class transformation has set them, now the normative (and majority) group of college faculty, clearly onto the other side of a class line from those who own, control and/or manage institutions of higher education in the United States. It is not so much that contingent faculty have become more differentiated from regular full-time (FTTT) faculty than before, but that they have become the norm. This change, of course has also impacted full-time faculty in many ways. The implications and details of these changes for full time faculty will be discussed in greater detail as a strategic consideration in a later section. Fundamentally, this is the classic proletarianization argument applied to higher education, just as this argument, now nearly universally accepted, was applied starting in the early 1900’s to public school teachers. This class line was the implied theoretical and practical basis for the rise of the AFT

and teacher unionism, as opposed to the NEA and the concept of the schoolmaster.” (Berry, ,2002, pp: 53-54).

To analyze the advent of labor flexibility and precariousness in the neo-liberal economy.

According with a labor expert and critic of neo-liberalism (Berry, 2005; 2002), who conducted a PhD dissertation analyzing the issues of academic tenure and the advent of renewable contracts, these issues are deeply rooted and interrelated with capitalism as a political and economical system, and particularly with the new neo-liberal ideology called *flexibility of labor*.

Hence, likewise, according to some Mexican sociologist of labor, the flexibility of labor has emerged along with the neo-liberal phase of capitalism since the 1970s. This is how they try to configure an explanation of this phenomenon that does not have a universal and epistemologically accepted definition:

“Flexibility of labor as a form would be the capability of management to adjust, the employment, the use of the labor in the productive process, and the salary, to the changing conditions of production, but this form might have various contents depending on the conceptions behind them, but above all of the interactions among the actors, the institutions, and standards, and cultures within and outside labor” (Bouzas and de la Garza, 1998, p. 35).

These are issues also analyzed in similar manners by the critical pedagogy (Giroux, 2012), the critical studies of communication (McChesney, 1996; 1998; 2001; McKercher, & Mosco, 2007; Mosco, & McKercher, 2009; Mosco, & Schiller, 2001; Mosco, 2005; 2009), and the critical economic studies (May, 2004).

Thus, by bringing insights from critical studies in labor sociology, critical pedagogy, analyzing some of the most critical consequences of capitalism in academia and scholarly issues, might help the authors, and the audience to bring critical perspectives to capitalism and neo-liberalism, and chances are, to come out with better understanding, and strategies to resist these challenges faced by worldwide academia and in particular LIS practice and theory.

Intrusion of the bourgeois corporation and State into universities.

The intrusion of the bourgeois corporation and the state, the bourgeois class in the public universities and in the public scientific matters is converting education, science, and information into an appendix without critique in favor of bourgeois corporations (Dilevko, 2009; Mattelart, 2007; Moles, 2006; Muela-Meza, 2005; May, 2004; Bakan, 2004; Marquand, 2004; Verzola, 2004; González, 2002; McChesney, 2001; 1998; 1996; Martin, 1998; Fox 1983).

Dilevko (2009), in his chapter 2. “Professionalism, achievement, and the quantified university” from his book: *The politics of professionalism: A retro-progressive proposal for librarianship*, addresses precisely how the bourgeois class has converted scientists and scholars since the beginnings of professionalism, and the universities y mere proletarian workers subject to the ups and downs of the class struggles between workers and bourgeois class, critically highlighting these elements where evidence is shown of such proletarianization subdued by the bourgeois, capitalist, and entrepreneurial corporatization, and ethos:

- a) The ambiguities of perfectionism and the quest for social status.
- b) Professional schools and the market model.
- c) The ideology of performance measure and audit culture.
- d) Disciplinary aspects of the audit culture.
- e) Metrics in universities and accountability in universities.
- f) The game of grants.
- g) The corporatization of higher education.
- h) Scientific research and the culture of competitive performance.
- i) The ideology of achievement.
- j) Multitasking and triviality.

Conclusions

This paper, based on the sources analyzed, concludes that the capitalist classes are eroding the full time tenure contracting and perpetuating the contingent adjunct faculty contracts affecting librarianship faculty and library workers based on the critical epistemology and critical theories and concepts, mainly comparing the U.S., British, Spanish, and Mexican librarianship. Based on some international critics of capitalism and neo-liberal policies (Bouzas and de la Garza, 1998; Berry, 2002; 2005; Boutang, 2004; Giroux, 2012), and underpinned with critical epistemology and critical librarianship concepts (Muela-Meza, 2004; 2007; 2008; 2010^a; 2010^b; Pawley, 1998; 2003; 2005; 2006; 2009), calls to the academic and library community to employ these concepts to analyze these issues as how they affect the workers of librarianship as academics and librarians (as in other non-library milieus e.g. Horner, 2000), and to some extent to present anti-capitalistic critiques as alternatives to neoliberal flexibility and precarious labor, in order to play a political, and ideological role along with wider leftist political movements, unions, and parties to restore the tenure system in benefit of all library workers’ labor and professional stability.

References

Anghelescu, H.G.B. & Poulain, M. (2001). *Books, Libraries, Reading & Publishing in the Cold War*. Washington, DC: The Library of Congress, The Center for the Book; Austin: The University of Texas Press.

Aslund, A. (Ed.) (1992). *Market Socialism or the Restoration of Capitalism?* Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Bakan, J. (2004). *The Corporation: The Pathological Pursuit Of Profit And Power.* London: Constable.

Berry, J. (2002). *Contingent Faculty in Higher Education: An Organizing Strategy and Chicago Area Proposal.* Chicago: Graduate College of the Union Institute and University, a PhD Thesis in Labor Studies. [Online] <http://www.chicagococal.org/downloads/JoeBerryDissertation.pdf> . [Accessed June 6, 2013].

Berry, J. (2005). *Reclaiming the Ivory Tower : Organizing Adjuncts to Change Higher Education.* New York : Monthly Review Press.

Boutang, Y.M. (2004). « Riqueza, propiedad, libertad y renta en el capitalismo cognitivo. » En: Blondeau, Olivier et. al. (2004). *Capitalismo cognitivo*, Mapas No. 8) [En línea]. http://e-tcs.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/10/E-Boutang-Riqueza_Propiedad_y_renta.pdf [Accesado <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1083-6101.1996.tb00177.x/full>

Bouzas, A. & de la Garza, E. (1998). *Flexibilidad del trabajo y contratación colectiva en México (Labor Flexibility and Collective Contracting in Mexico).* México: UNAM, Instituto de Investigaciones Económicas; Editorial Cambio XXI.

Cárdenas-Zardoni, Horacio. (2010). “¿Y si el bibliotecario fuera académico? La problemática laboral de los bibliotecarios que trabajan en universidades públicas estatales.” *Crítica Bibliotecológica: Revista de las Ciencias de la Información Documental*, **2** (2) & **3** (1), pp.78-103. [En línea] <http://eprints.rclis.org/15100/1/c.b.vol.2.no.2%26vol.3.no.1.cardenas.pdf> . [Accesado 15 mayo 2012].

Castells, M. (1996). *The rise of the network society.* Malden, Mass.: Blackwell Publishers.

Corrigan, P. & Gillespie, V. (1978). *Class Struggle, Social Literacy and Idle Time: The Provision of Public Libraries in England as a Case Study in the “the Organisation of Leisure with Indirect Educational Results.”* Brighton, E. Sussex, UK: Studies in Labour History / Librarians for Social Change; John L. Noyce.

Cronin, B. (1992b). *The Marketing of Library and Information Services 2.* London: Aslib.

de la Garza Toledo, E. (2001). "La epistemología crítica y el concepto de configuración: Alternativas a la estructura y función estándar de la teoría." *Revista Mexicana de Sociología*. (1) [En línea]. <http://docencia.izt.uam.mx/egt/publicaciones/articulos/index.htm> . [Accesado 28 de julio de 2006].

Dilevko, J. (2009). *The politics of professionalism: A retro-progressive proposal for librarianship*. Duluth, MN, USA: Library Juice Press.

Ferrer Rodríguez, E. (1995). *De la lucha de clases a la lucha de frases (De la propaganda a la publicidad)*. Nueva edición corregida y ampliada. México: Aguilar; Altea; Taurus; Alfaguara.

Giroux, H. (2012). "The disappearance of public intellectuals. *CounterPunch*, Oct 8, 2012. [Online] <http://www.counterpunch.org/2012/10/08/the-disappearance-of-public-> . [Accessed June 6, 2013].

Gorman, M. (2001). "The future of LIS research." *Norsk Tidsskrift for Biblioteksforskning*, No. 16, pp. 23-33. Citado por: Talja, S., Tuominen, K., Savolainen, R. (2005). "Isms' in information science: constructivism, collectivism and constructionism." *Journal of Documentation*, 61 (1).

Guerrero Valle, E.M. (2000). "El impacto tecnológico en la legislación sobre derechos de autor." *AR: Revista de Derecho Informático*. (18). [En línea] <http://www.alfaredi.org/rdi-articulo.shtml?x=404> . [Accesado el 13 de julio de 2005].

Hauser, M. D. (2006). *Moral minds: how nature designed our universal sense of right and wrong*. New York; Harper Collins.

Hernández Pacheco, F. (2000). *El bibliotecólogo emprendedor : un reto del Siglo XXI*. México: Universidad Latinoamericana; Colegio Nacional de Bibliotecarios; Información Científica Internacional.

Hernández Pacheco, F. (2007) Nuevos paradigmas para la formación de los recursos humanos en bibliotecas y centros de documentación. *Documentación de las Ciencias de la Información*. Vol. 30, 65-99

Horner, B. (2000). "Politics, pedagogy, and the profession of composition: confronting commodification and the contingencies of power." *Journal of Advance Composition*, 20 (1), pp. 121-152. [Online] <http://www.jstor.org/stable/20866302> . [Accessed June 6, 2013].

Lau Noriega, J. (2007b). "Introducción." En: Lau Noriega, J. (2007^a). *Ambiente laboral: estrategias para el trabajo efectivo en bibliotecas*. Buenos Aires: Alfagrama;

Veracruz, México: Universidad Veracruzana; México: Library Outsourcing Service (Series: ALCI Administración y Liderazgo en el Campo Informativo, año 2005); pp. 11-16.

Lau Noriega, J. (2007b). “Introducción.” En: Lau Noriega, J. (2007^a). *Ambiente laboral: estrategias para el trabajo efectivo en bibliotecas*. Buenos Aires: Alfagrama; Veracruz, México: Universidad Veracruzana; México: Library Outsourcing Service (Series: ALCI Administración y Liderazgo en el Campo Informativo, año 2005); pp. 11-16.

Lau Noriega, J. (2007c). “Retos sindicales en bibliotecas universitarias: un estudio.” En: Lau Noriega, J. (2007^a). *Ambiente laboral: estrategias para el trabajo efectivo en bibliotecas (Labor Environment: Strategies for an Effective Work in Libraries)*. Buenos Aires: Alfagrama; Veracruz, México: Universidad Veracruzana; México: Library Outsourcing Service (Series: ALCI Administración y Liderazgo en el Campo Informativo, año 2005); pp. 97-170.

Lau Noriega, J. (comp). (2007a). *Ambiente laboral: estrategias para el trabajo efectivo en bibliotecas (Labor Environment: Strategies for an Effective Work in Libraries)*. Buenos Aires: Alfagrama; Veracruz, México: Universidad Veracruzana; México: Library Outsourcing Service (Series: ALCI Administración y Liderazgo en el Campo Informativo, año 2005).

Lenin, V.I. ([1905] 1974). (What is to be done) *¿Qué hacer? Problemas candentes de nuestro movimiento*. Pekin: Ediciones en Lenguas Extranjeras.

Mann, T. (1993). *Library research models: A guide to classification, cataloging, and computers*. New York; Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Marquand, D. (2004). *Decline of the Public: The Hollowing-out of Citizenship*. Cambridge, UK; Malden, MA, USA: Polity.

Martin, B. (1998). *Information Liberation: Challenging the Corruptions of Information Power*. London: Freedom Press. Accessed 14 September 2003 in: <http://www.uow.edu.au/arts/sts/bmartin/pubs/98il/ilall.pdf>

Marx, K. & Engels, F. (1976a). *Karl Marx and Frederick Engels Collected Works. Vol. 5*. London: Lawrence & Wishart; Moscow: Progress Publishers; Institute of Marxism-Leninism Moscow. (Marx and Engels: 1845-47).

Marx, K. ([1867], 1974). *Capital: A Critical Analysis Of Capitalist Production. Volume 1*. London: Lawrence & Wishart; Moscow: Foreign Languages Publishing House.

Masuda, Y. (1981) *The information society as post-industrial society*. Washington, D.C.: World Future Society.

Mattelart, A. (2007). *Historia de la sociedad de la información. Nueva edición revisada y ampliada (History of information society. New revised and extended edition)*. Barcelona: Paidós.

May, C. (2004). Commodifying the 'information age': intellectual property rights, the state and the internet. *SCRIPT-ed*. 1 (3), pp. 408-419.

McChesney, R. W. (1996), The Internet and U. S. Communication Policy-Making in Historical and Critical Perspective: McChesney. *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, 1: 0. doi: 10.1111/j.1083-6101.1996.tb00177.x

McChesney, R.W. (1998). "Introducción." En: Chomsky, N. (2009). *El beneficio es lo que cuenta. Neoliberalismo y orden global, 6ta ed.* Barcelona: Crítica (Col: Biblioteca de Bolsillo No. 60).

McChesney, R.W. (2001). "Global media, neoliberalism, and imperialism." *Monthly Review*; 52 (10).

McKercher, C. & Mosco, V. (Eds). (2007). "Introduction: Theorizing knowledge labor and information society." In: McKercher, C. & Mosco, V. (Eds). (2007). *Knowledge Workers in the Information Society*. Lanham, Maryland: Lexington Books, pp. vi-xxiv.

Mosco, V. & McKercher, C. (2009). *The Laboring of Communication. Will knowledge Workers of the World Unite?* Lanham, Maryland: Lexington Books.

Mosco, V. & Schiller, D. (Eds). (2001). *Continental Order? Integrating North America for Cybercapitalism*. Lanham, Maryland: Rowman and Littlefield.

Mosco, V. (2005). *The Digital Sublime: Myth, Power, and Cyberspace*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Mosco, V. (2009). *The Political Economy of Communication. 2nd Ed.* London: Sage.

Muela-Meza, Z.M. (2001) "Impulsemos en serio el desarrollo de las bibliotecas públicas mexicanas" ("Let us really promote the development of the Mexican public libraries."). In *Proceedings Primer Congreso Nacional de Bibliotecas Públicas y Centros de Documentación : Futuro y Perspectivas de los Servicios Bibliotecarios y de Información*, Saltillo, Coahuila (Mexico) (but excluded for its publication in the proceedings). <http://eprints.rclis.org/archive/00003597/> .
<http://web.archive.org/web/20020607211432/www.acsu.buffalo.edu/~zmmuela/mexpublib.htm> .

Muela-Meza, Z.M. (2004) "Liberación de la información como condición de la liberación del acceso a la información " En: *Primer Foro Social de Información, Documentación y Bibliotecas. "Programas de acción alternativa desde Latinoamérica para la sociedad del conocimiento* Buenos Aires, Buenos Aires, Argentina. En línea: <http://eprints.rclis.org/archive/00003623/> .

Muela-Meza, Z.M. (2007). "Contradicciones éticas en las responsabilidades sociales de la bibliotecología." En: Gimeno Perelló, J. & López López, P. (Eds.). *De volcanes llena: Bibliotecas y compromiso social*. Capítulo 14, pp.417-444, Guijón, Asturias, Spain: Trea. [in Spanish]. Accessible in open access through E-LIS: <http://eprints.rclis.org/archive/00011805/> .

Muela-Meza, Z.M. (2008). "Pensamiento crítico y escéptico en las ciencias de la información documental." *Crítica Bibliotecológica: Revista de las Ciencias de la Información Documental*, **1** (1), pp. 14-41. <http://critica.bibliotecologica.googlepages.com/vol.1.no.1> .

Muela-Meza, Z.M. (2010b). "The social class struggles concept with an interdisciplinary approach: a paramount concept for research in library and information science (LIS)." In *Crítica Bibliotecológica: Revista de las Ciencias de la Información Documental (Library and Information Science Critique: Journal of the Sciences of Information Recorded in Documents)*, **3** (1), pp. 8-36. <http://eprints.rclis.org/bitstream/10760/15091/1/c.b.vol.2.no.2%26vol.3.no.1.muela-meza.art.pdf> .

Muela-Meza, Zapopan Martín. (2010a). *An Application of Community Profiling to Analyse Community Information Needs, and Providers: Perceptions from the People of the Broomhall Neighbourhood of Sheffield, UK*. Sheffield, UK: University of Sheffield, Department of Information Studies. [PhD Thesis]. Accessible in open access through my personal archive E-LIS: <http://eprints.rclis.org/handle/10760/14659> .

Pawley, Cristine. (1998). "Hegemony's handmaid? The library and information studies curriculum from a class perspective," *The Library Quarterly*, **68** (2): 123-44.

Pawley, Cristine. (2003). "Information Literacy: A Contradictory Coupling," *The Library Quarterly*, **73** (4): 422-452.

Pawley, Cristine. (2005). "Gorman's gauntlet: gender and 'crying wolf.'" *Journal of Education for Library and Information Science*, **46** (4): 304-312.

Pawley, Cristine. (2006). "Unequal legacies: race and multiculturalism in the lis curriculum." *The Library Quarterly*, **76** (2): 149-168.

Pawley, Cristine. (2009). "Beyond market models and resistance: organizations as a middle layer in the history of reading." *The Library Quarterly*, **79** (1): 73-93.
propiedad intelectual y creación colectiva. Madrid: Traficantes de sueños (Col.

Real Academia Española. (1992). *Diccionario de la Lengua Española*, 21^a ed. Madrid: Real Academia Española.

Rodríguez Gallardo, José Adolfo. (2001) Formación humanística del bibliotecólogo: hacia su recuperación. México: UNAM-CUIB.

Robledo Esparza., G. (1975b). "El revisionismo, el oportunismo y el dogmatismo en México. (Revisionism, opportunism, and dogmatism in Mexico)." In: Robledo Esparza, G. (1975). *El desarrollo del capitalismo mexicano*, 1^a ed. (*The Development of Mexican Capitalism*). Parras, Coahuila, Mexico: Edición del autor; Talleres Linotipográficos El Popular.

Robledo E., G. (1975a). *El desarrollo del capitalismo mexicano*, 1^a ed. (*The Development of Mexican Capitalism*). Parras, Coahuila, Mexico: Edición del autor; Talleres Linotipográficos El Popular.

Tercer Coloquio ALCI. (2007). "Anexo. Declaratoria. Ambiente Laboral: Estrategias para el Trabajo Efectivo en Bibliotecas." En: Lau Noriega, J. (2007^a). *Ambiente laboral: estrategias para el trabajo efectivo en bibliotecas*. Buenos Aires: Alfagrama; Veracruz, México: Universidad Veracruzana; México: Library Outsourcing Service (Series: ALCI Administración y Liderazgo en el Campo Informativo, año 2005); pp. 317-320.

Uribe Tirado, A. (2005). Las unidades de información y empresas informativo-documentales que se requieren hoy en América Latina : una mirada desde la gerencia y el mercadeo con responsabilidad social. (English tr: The information units and informational-documental companies required today in Latin America: a look from the managerialism and marketing with social responsibility). *Revista Interamericana de Bibliotecología*, **28** (2):pp. 11-41. **CB**.